Index

abortion 82–3, 92, 126–9, 143, 202
accountability
democratic accountability of ECtHR 7–8
Adams, Maurice 168, 169, 170
advisory opinions 174, 190, 206–207
interaction between ECtHR and national authorities and 129–34
Afghanistan 30
Alkema, Evert 168, 170, 175, 177
amicus curiae
amicus curiae project
broad spectrum of solutions 179
collaboration and shifting of competences 177–9
impetus for 158–61
need for constructive solutions and 165–8
solutions at domestic level 175–7
solutions relating to procedures and remedies 172–5
what court can do to address criticism 168–72
as means to reinforce legitimacy of ECtHR 135–6, 146
coherence and consistency based legitimacy 137–42
institutional legitimacy 143–4
procedural legitimacy 144–6
applications to ECtHR
inadmissible applications/petitions 13, 19, 22–3, 63
individual applications 6–7, 12, 25–6, 196–7
costs and benefits of individual right to petition ECtHR 60–64
meritorious applications 13–14, 15–16, 20, 24–5
repetitive applications 14, 23–4, 43–4, 203
artificial reproduction 15–16
assisted suicide 141
asylum cases 27, 41, 78, 86, 88, 198–9
attribution of extraterritorial effects to Art 6 ECHR 33–5
extension of applicability of Art 3 ECHR to living conditions 31–3
fact-finding 83–4
recognition of vulnerable population groups in need of special protection 29–31
threshold for violations of Art 3 ECHR 28–9
Australia 92
Austria 15–16
backlash against ECtHR xi, xii, 43–4, 193, 197, 202, 203, 209, 210
Bates, Ed 119
Belgium
asylum seekers 32, 58, 86, 198–9
criticism of ECtHR in 42, 74, 163–4
Bingham, Lord 1, 7, 99
Bojin, Lucian 54–64, 209
Borrego, Javier 74–5, 78, 79
Bossuyt, Marc 42, 59, 61, 74, 164, 197, 201, 202
bounce back procedure 173–4
Bradley, Anthony 207, 208
Bratza, Nicolas 77
Brauch, Jeffrey A. 79, 90
Brighton Declaration 3, 4, 7, 12, 13, 38, 52, 76, 77, 86, 117, 118, 119, 129, 130, 133, 166, 185, 188, 189, 196, 204, 205, 207, 208, 209, 210
Broeksteeg, Hansko 171
budget of the ECtHR 42–3
Bulgaria 70

Spyridon Flogaitis, Tom Zwart and Julie Fraser - 9781782546122
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/04/2019 08:28:10PM
via free access
The European Court of Human Rights and its discontents

Burkov, Anton 207, 208
Bürli, Nicole 199
Buyse, Antoine 176, 178
Cameron, David 76
capital punishment 137–8
challenges facing ECtHR 54
differences and divisions between Eastern and Western Europe 59–60
fragmentation and defragmentation of international order 54–8
children
access to 145
protection of 31
civil law systems 102
clarity in ECtHR jurisprudence of ECHR 101
Committee of Ministers xiii, 3, 14, 23, 24, 39, 52, 68, 86, 87, 102–3, 130, 133, 164, 174, 178, 184, 193, 196, 200, 203–5, 207, 209
common law systems 102
conscious objectors 49
consensus 89–93
determining European consensus 139–41
European consensus and its role in ECtHR’s case law 121–2
trumping European consensus by internal consensus 122–9
consistency
amicus curiae as means to reinforce coherence and consistency based legitimacy 137–42
in jurisprudence of ECtHR 6, 20, 48, 57, 85, 100–102, 195, 199, 203
constitutional state, definition of 1
constitutions, human rights in 2–3
corporal punishment 124
Corstens, Geert 173, 177
Costa, Jean-Paul 9, 76, 77, 78, 80, 94
crisis of the ECtHR 161–5, 193–202
criticism facing ECtHR 3–4, 9, 16–17, 37–9, 51–3, 71, 72–8, 163–5
amicus curiae project and broad spectrum of solutions 179

Spyridon Flogaitis, Tom Zwart and Julie Fraser - 9781782546122
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/04/2019 08:28:10PM via free access
Index

questions of legitimacy 5–6
Russia 73
source of 39–42
Spain 74–5
United Kingdom 42, 72, 75–6, 163, 164
volume of applications 4–5, 42–3
prospects for the future 19–21
solutions to workload quagmire 11–16
damages, punitive 175
Davis, David 123, 200, 201
death penalty 137–8
democracy 99, 143
democratic accountability of ECtHR 7–8, 199–202
process of 69
see also prisoner voting rights
departure from recent case law 49
discretion of the court 63, 89, 120, 144
divisions between Eastern and Western Europe 59–60
Dothan, Shai 79
Dzehtsiarou, Kanstantsin 91, 200, 207
Eastern Europe
differences and divisions between Eastern and Western Europe 59–60
Easton, David 81
economic and social rights 30, 32, 34, 35, 59, 60, 197
education in human rights 177, 207
electoral rights of prisoners see prisoner voting rights
European Convention on Human Rights 2, 9
as common European endeavour 192–3
backlog and backlash 193–202
proposed solutions to backlog and backlash 202–9
road ahead for ECtHR 209–10
extension of applicability of Art 3 to living conditions 31–3
extraterritorial effects 33–5, 54–5
implementation 6–7
Russia 148–53
promotion of 207–9
threshold for violations of Art 3 28–9
European Court of Justice (ECJ/CJEU) 131, 178
European Law Institute 18
euthanasia 141
evidence, hearsay 106–8
execution of ECtHR judgments 23–24, 39, 83, 86–7, 174, 176, 203
extradition of terrorism suspects 18, 33, 56–8, 94–5
fact-finding 83–4
failure of ECtHR’s current strategies 78–81
fair trial right, extraterritorial effects of Art 6 ECHR and 33–5
Fernhout, Roel 169, 171, 173
filtering procedure of selecting cases 60–61, 173
fines 175
Flinterman, Kees 172
fragmentation and defragmentation of international order 54–8
Fribergh, Eric 14
Georgia 87
Gerards, Janneke 171, 201, 204, 207, 209
Germany 69, 74
Goodwin, Morag 171
Greece
asylum seekers 31–2, 58, 86, 198–9
Greens, Robert 66
Grieve, Dominic 67
Groot, Hugo de 99
harmonisation of national laws 46–7
hearsay evidence 106–8
Hendriks, Aart 176
Heringa, Aalt Willem 168, 169, 174, 175, 177
Herzog, Roman 69
Hirsch Ballin, Ernst 169, 177, 178
Hirst, John 66
Hoffmann, Lord 61, 72
Hollobone, Philip 123
homosexual relationships 125–6, 141–2
human rights I
promoting common understanding of European human rights 183–4
backlog of applications 184–5
cooperation between court and national judiciaries and authorities 189–91
primary state responsibility and subsidiarity principle 187–8
resources and independence of the court 188–9
structural shortcomings at national level 185–7
way forward for European human rights 191
Strasbourg court’s role in protection of 2–3
human rights institutes 176
implementation of European Convention on Human Rights 4,
21, 39, 45, 51, 116–117, 190, 207–209
Russia
courts and 149–53
improvement in 156–7
legislation 148–9
obstacles and options for improving application of ECHR 153–6
inadmissible applications 13, 19, 22–3, 63
independence of the court 188–9
individual application/petition to ECHR 6–7, 12, 25–6, 196–7
costs and benefits of individual right to petition 60–64
inefficiency of ECHR 18–19
informal legitimacy of ECHR 100
institutional legitimacy 143–4
interim measures 27–8, 35–6, 94
international law 1, 56, 57, 61, 99, 156, 188, 207
international order, fragmentation and defragmentation of 54–8
interpretation methods 39, 47–8, 49, 67, 87–93, 201
interaction between ECHR and member states and 118
European consensus and its role in ECHR’s case law 121–2
margin of appreciation 6, 34, 38, 39, 45–48, 49, 53, 66–68,
171, 182, 186, 200
trumping European consensus by internal consensus 122–9
interrogations 101
Ireland
abortion debate 82–3, 92, 126–9, 143, 202
Islam 41
Italy 5, 12, 66–7
Jacobs, Francis 99
Janssen, Heleen 169, 175, 177
judges 172–3, 188–9
judicial activism 10, 12, 51, 82
judicial restraint 51
judgments, execution of 86–7, 174
Judt, Tony 99
Jurisconsult 48, 199
jurisdiction of ECHR 39, 50, 101–2
jurisprudence of ECHR, weaknesses of 100
clarity and reasoning 101
consistency and predictability 101–2
understanding of common versus continental law 102
Kempen, Piet Hein van 168, 170
Kerr, Lord 72, 206, 209
Krisch, Nico 121
Kuijer, Martin 170, 173, 174
Kuiper, Reindert 173, 177
Lange, Roel de 168, 169, 173, 175
Lawson, Rick 173–4
legitimacy of ECHR 5–6, 43–4, 80–81, 117, 199–202
amici curiae as means to reinforce 135–6, 146
coherece and consistency based legitimacy 137–42
institutional legitimacy 143–4
procedural legitimacy 144–6
importance of interaction with
member states for ECtHR’s
legitimacy 133–4
informal 100
‘living instrument’ doctrine and 98–9
methods of restoration of 82–3
fact-finding 83–4
interpretation 87–93
prescribing States how to execute
its judgments 86–7
sticking to precedent 84–6
need to regain legitimacy 81–2
reducing workload by restoration of
93–5
‘living instrument’ doctrine 2, 49, 50,
67, 78, 85, 88, 198–9
legitimacy of ECtHR and 98–9
Loenen, Titia 170
Mahoney, Paul 195, 196, 203, 204
margin of appreciation 6, 45–6, 68, 79,
89
interaction between ECtHR and
member States and 118, 119–21
national courts and 108–9
member States of the EU 116–17
advisory opinions and interaction
between ECtHR and national
authorities 129–33
importance of interaction for
ECtHR’s legitimacy 133–4
interaction between ECtHR and
member States through
interpretation 118
European consensus and its role in
ECtHR’s case law 121–2
margin of appreciation 118,
119–21
trumping European consensus by
internal consensus 122–9
primary state responsibility and
subsidiarity principle 187–8
structural shortcomings at national
level 185–7
meritorious applications 13–14, 15–16,
20, 24–5
Mertens, Thomas 171
mistakes made by ECtHR 48–50
Moldova 70
Morijn, John 178–9
Myjer, Egbert 79, 202
national courts 96, 205–7
amicus curiae project and 175–7
criticism of ECtHR by 105–6
following or leading ECtHR 109–11
example of Al-Skeini case 111–13
UK’s reluctance to lead or follow
113–15
importance of ECtHR case law for
96–8
informal legitimacy of ECtHR and
100
‘living instrument’ doctrine and
legitimacy of ECtHR 98–9
margin of appreciation and 108–9
need for dialogue with ECtHR 104–5
positive engagement between ECtHR
and 106–8
promoting common understanding of
European human rights and
189–91
Russian courts’ application of ECHR
149–53
weaknesses of jurisprudence of
ECtHR and 100–102
Netherlands
amicus curiae project
broad spectrum of solutions 179
collaboration and shifting of
competences 177–9
impetus for 158–61
need for constructive solutions and
165–8
solutions at domestic level 175–7
solutions relating to procedures
and remedies 172–5
what court can do to address
criticism 168–72
contributions to debate on value of
ECtHR 180–81
results of debate 181–2
criticism of ECtHR in 37, 40, 52–3,
75, 76, 163, 164–5, 167
importance of ECtHR case law for
national courts 97–8
as means to reinforce legitimacy of
ECtHR 135–6, 146
relationship between national courts
and ECtHR 101, 102–3, 205
amicus curiae project and 175–7
Neuberger, Lord 72
New Zealand 92
Norway 125
O’Boyle, Michael 90, 122
O’Donnell, Thomas A. 120
Oomen, Barbara 176–7
Opstelten, Ivo 38, 42, 195, 197
Ostrovsky, Aaron A. 120
outcome orientation 78
Oven, Gerritjan van 172, 173, 174, 177, 178
ovum donation 15–16
parental leave 73
parliamentary sovereignty 99
pilot procedure 47, 173
precedent 33, 49, 83, 84–86, 101, 198–199
predictability in jurisprudence of
ECtHR 100–102, 198
preliminary review 132
prisoner voting rights 65–6, 79, 80, 88, 122–3, 200
case law of ECtHR 66–7
consequences of current standoff for
UK-ECtHR relations 69–70
reasons for Court overreaching 67–9
procedural legitimacy 144–6
promoting common understanding of
European human rights 183–4
backlog of applications 184–5
cooperation between court and
national judiciaries and
authorities 189–91
primary state responsibility and
subsidiarity principle 187–8
resources and independence of the
court 188–9
structural shortcomings at national
level 185–7
way forward for European human
rights 191
punitive damages 175
quality checks 48
Rawls, John 62
reflective equilibrium arguments 62
refugees see asylum cases
repetitive applications 14, 23–4, 43–4, 203
resources of the court 188–9, 195
restrictions on human rights 5
Rieter, Eva 173, 176, 178
Romania 5
rule of law 1, 99, 177
Russia 5, 70, 147–8, 208
criticism of ECtHR in 73
improvement in implementation of
ECHR 156–7
legislation on implementation of
ECHR 148–9
obstacles and options for improving
application of ECHR 153–6
Sajó, András 192, 200–201, 204, 206
Sanderink, Dirk 171
Schutgens, Roel 168, 170
Serbia 208
Sillen, Joost 168, 170
single-judge procedure 13, 19
social rights 35, 59
Spain
criticism of ECtHR in 74–5
sperm donation 15–16
Spijkerboer, Thomas 170, 172, 175
Stewart, Potter 91
Straw, Jack 123
structural shortcomings at national level
185–7
subsidiarity principle 42, 45, 74, 187–8
Sunstein, Cass R. 62
Teitgen, Pierre-Henri 11
Terlouw, Ashley 173, 174, 177, 201, 204, 207, 209
terrorism 18, 41
Thomassen, Wilhelmina 173, 177, 206
torture, prohibition of 31, 56–7, 94–5
transgender people 79, 91, 140
Turkey 5, 89, 159–60
Twain, Mark 13

Ukraine 5
understanding of human rights
backlash against ECtHR 43–4, 193, 197
promoting common understanding of European human rights 183–4
backlog of applications 184–5
cooperation between court and national judiciaries and authorities 189–91
primary state responsibility and subsidiarity principle 187–8
resources and independence of the court 188–9
structural shortcomings at national level 185–7
way forward for European human rights 191
United Kingdom
amicus curiae interventions 137–9, 140–41
corporal punishment 124
criticism of ECtHR in 42, 72, 75–6, 163, 164
direct application of ECHR 7
extradition of terrorism suspects 18, 33, 56–8, 94
homosexual relationships 125–6
importance of ECHR case law for national courts 97
prisoner voting rights 65–6, 79, 80, 88, 122–3, 200

United States of America 84

Vlemminx, Frank 175
volume of applications to ECHR 4–5, 42–3, 116, 162, 184–5, 193–5
prospects for the future 19–21
reducing workload by restoration of legitimacy 93–5
solutions to workload quagmire 11–16, 202–9
inadmissible applications 13, 19, 22–3, 63
meritorious applications 13–14, 15–16, 20, 24–5
repetitive applications 14, 23–4, 43–4, 203
voting rights of prisoners see prisoner voting rights

Wiarda, Gerard 51
Wildhaber, Luzius 196, 203, 204
Yourow, Howard Charles 120
Zorkin, Valery 73–4
Zwart, Tom 178, 195, 197, 198, 199, 200, 201, 204