Index

adjudication, legal
see also decision making, judicial;
discretion, judicial
binding precedents see binding precedents
coexistence of rule-like and standard-based solutions 26 context 28–9
classification decisions 64
decision making, judicial 59
earlier 25–6
ex ante versus ex post decision making 93
flexibility of standards 47
guidance of future decisions 48
BioIndustry Association, case law 108, 265, 266
Bochnovic, John 152–6, 158, 159
'bright line' test 3, 4, 151, 221
Brimelow, Alison (EPO President) 144
Burrell, R 28
Castells, Manuel 253
cDNA fragments, case law 119
celebrity endorsement 52, 53
celebrity merchandising 53
Christie, Andrew 33
classical trinity (principles of law binding present and future courts) 49, 53
coherence requirement, judicial decision making 44, 45
morality issues, and bias 114–15
Colomer, Ruiz-Jarabo 115
colour, registration as a trade mark 27–8
compensation, entitlement of employee inventors to 38–9, 41
compilations 10, 162–4, 193, 195, 196, 198
compensation, entitlement of employee inventors to 38–9, 41
computer programs 7, 164, 165
confidentiality, breach of 76
confusion, likelihood of in trade mark cases 6, 101, 102, 103
consequential reasoning 106
constructive trusts 74
context, importance in legal adjudication 28–9
Convention on the Grant of European Patents see European Patent Convention (EPC)
copying of work 10, 18, 42–3, 167, 195 see also copyright; skill, labour and judgement
electronic 180, 183
and infringement 148, 212, 219
music 193, 194, 200, 204
negligence 43
and originality 163, 198, 199–200
paintings 201, 202–3
part of a work 148, 167, 218
photographs 201–2
proof of 213
protection against 216
significant characteristics 236
skill, labour and judgement 193, 194, 198, 201
subconscious 20
unaltered 211
wholesale 216
work which is itself copied 10, 148
copyright 9–10, 12–13, 14, 19–21, 192–223
artistic work 201, 202–3, 210
classification of works, proposal for abolition 33
compilations 10, 162–4, 193, 195, 196, 198
copying of work see copying of work denial of 195–6
established characters 44–5
‘Europeanization’ of UK copyright law 217
examination 271–2
ideas versus expression 190, 208, 212–14
Information Society Directive 165, 168, 191, 205, 217, 220, 221, 222
infringement claims 41, 54, 148, 167, 193, 204–17, 219
and internet 182–3
literary, dramatic, musical and artistic works: originality requirement 160
morality issues, and bias 111–13
originality condition see originality condition, copyright
partial taking 10, 14, 37, 59, 72, 93, 165, 167, 168, 217, 219
piracy 183
protectable subject matter, defining boundaries of 27, 147–8, 160–70, 176
Index

reproduction right 217
risk 215, 216, 221
rule-bound decisions 148, 219, 222–3, 248
skill, labour and judgement, originality 161–3, 166, 193, 194, 196–9
statutory defences based on ‘fair dealing’ 39
subsistence and infringement 27, 169, 269
substantial taking 13, 72, 169, 206, 211, 213, 221
traditional UK law 160
UK approach to categorization 167
Cornish, W 74, 82, 84, 153, 155, 161, 223, 230, 266, 271
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) 14, 33, 93, 175, 217, 263–4
European integration, harmonization and form 143, 144
ex ante versus ex post decision making 100, 101, 103
trade marks 235, 240, 241, 244, 248
courts
creation of law by 30, 107
disagreements between EPC and UK courts 130
inductive reasoning of 26, 64–5, 67, 107
whether EPO decisions binding on UK courts 130
Creative Commons organization 184
critical legal studies movement 40–41
lex
rules versus standards debate 36, 37
strong versus weak sense 35
Diver, Colin 31
Drahos, Peter 54, 149, 177, 178, 206, 215, 229, 283, 285, 288
Drassinower, Abraham 290
duties, creation of scheme 29
Dworkin, Ronald 30–31, 35, 38, 40, 41, 267

binding precedents 59
containing rulings in points of law versus propositions of good sense 63
deductive reasoning by courts 31
distribution pattern 29
ex ante versus ex post 92–105, 224
facts see facts, judicial
decision-making
faith in decision making of experts 118
flexibility in 27, 32
foundling of decision on an error of principle 42, 43
guidance of future decisions 48
inductive reasoning by courts 26, 64–5, 67, 107
prejudices, perceptions of 91
principled decisions 55, 59
rules or standards 26–7
deductive reasoning by courts 31
Demsetz, Harold 261–2
digitization 7, 183
Dinwoodie, Graeme 251
Diplock, William John Kenneth (Baron) 15, 48, 49, 50, 59–61, 84, 92, 223, 225, 226
discoveries, exclusion from patentable subject matter 70
discretion, judicial 25

concepts/definitions 41–2
explanative 48
findings of primary fact 42
of future decision makers 48
infringement of copyright 54
purpose of legal provision, clarity of 36
rules versus standards debate 36, 37
strong versus weak sense 35
Diver, Colin 31
Drahos, Peter 54, 149, 177, 178, 206, 215, 229, 283, 285, 288
Drassinower, Abraham 290
duties, creation of scheme 29
Dworkin, Ronald 30–31, 35, 38, 40, 41, 267
Form in intellectual property law

electronic communications 182
employee inventors, entitlement to compensation 38–9, 41
Endicott, T 46, 54
EPC see European Patent Convention (EPC)
EPO Boards 124, 127
see also European Patent Office (EPO)
Boards of Appeal 8, 128, 129, 138, 145
Enlarged Board of Appeal 96, 139, 144, 145
Technical Board of Appeal (TBA) 68–9, 120, 140
equity
duality between law, and 74, 86 as instrument of justice 84 recourse to 5 role in legal adjudication 26, 72
European Commission, Green Paper (1997) 142
European Court of Justice see Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)
European Patent Convention (EPC) 7, 8 core purpose 127, 138 disagreements with UK courts 130 and European Union 127 harmonization attempts 135 invention to have been made available to the public 173 inventions and moral issues 117 member states 125, 130 patentable subject matter under 29, 67–8
European Patent Office (EPO) 7, 29, 272, 273 see also inventions; patents Administrative Council 141 ‘any hardware approach’ 132, 133–4 attempts to disguise decision making 137
Boards see EPO Boards decisions of, whether binding at national level 130 Examining Division 68 law-making power 67
morality issues, and bias 117
Opposition Division 119–20, 122–3 primary responsibility 140 problem and solution approach 152 Technical Board of Appeal (TBA) 131, 132
European Union (EU) 14 first-to-file approach 91, 98 harmonization mechanisms 127 impact of UK’s probable exit from institutions 142 integration and harmonization 91, 125–46 member states 160 originality condition, copyright 220, 221 patent system 29, 137–8 ex ante versus ex post decision making 91, 92–105, 224 trade marks 99–105 experimentation, inventions 59, 60, 62
facts, judicial decision making assessment of 35–6 discovery of 36 establishment of 31 finding of specific fact versus inference from facts specifically found 36 findings of primary fact 42 hearing of appeals, errors of principle 42, 43 inventions 34 person skilled in the relevant art 56
fairness
adoption of relevant factors 41 application by judges 6, 71 copyright statutory defences based on ‘fair dealing’ 39 employee inventors’ entitlement to compensation 38–9, 41 fair dealing, publication of private memoranda 45 and obviousness 44 principles laying beyond legal provision 43–4
Index

trade marks 247–8
ubiquity of term, in English law 44
filtration processes, case law 60
final injunctions 78–9, 80, 81–2
flexibility
  injunctions 4–5
judicial discretion and legal standards
  27, 32, 45, 47
  passing off, tort of 48–9
value in 3
flocculating agents, case law 60, 61
Fox, H 154–5
Fry Committee 271

Gangjee, Dev 251
Gerhardt, Deborah 256
glutamine synthetase inhibitors, plant
cells resistant to 123
goodwill 50, 53, 65, 66
Gratwick, S 153, 154
Griffiths, Andrew 158, 263, 264
Griffiths, Jonathan 206–7

H2-preprorelaxin, case law 119
Handler, M 28
Hargreaves Review (2011) 182, 214
harmonization and integration,
  European 125–46
  adoption of rules and standards at
  supra-national level 7, 125–6
  Biotechnology Directive example
  127
codification 125–6
harmonization goal as overriding
  objective 138
originality test 165
  and UK Court of Appeal 128
Hepatitis C virus (HCV), case law 80
Heydon, J D 44
Hoffmann, Leonard Hubert (Baron) 15,
  34, 37, 38, 42, 43, 54–5, 63, 128,
  130, 150, 152, 156, 159, 168, 172,
  173, 205–7, 211, 216, 217, 220,
  248
Hohfeld, Wesley 29–30, 105, 215
Holmes, Oliver Wendell 203
Hughes, Justin 197, 207, 231, 283, 284

ideas versus expression 190, 208,
  212–14
identity 11, 17, 192, 206, 253
defined 253
double 239, 241, 246
individual 123, 253
trade marks 10, 149, 175, 191, 239,
  240, 241, 244, 248, 251, 254,
  256, 282
individualism 12, 181
  and altruism 16–17, 180, 182, 185,
  189–92, 203, 204, 213, 217, 232,
  249, 252–4, 256
economic 186, 187
Kantian 287–9
liberal 23, 283, 286, 288
  and patents 191
political 188
  and rules 188, 189, 203
  and trade marks 191
inductive reasoning of courts 26, 64–5,
  67, 107

inflexibility
  see also flexibility
  non-express trusts 72
  and requirement regarding harm 72
  of rules 46–7, 71
infringement claims 27
copyright 41, 54, 148, 167, 193,
  204–17, 219
counter-claims 170
declarations of non-infringement of
  copyright 169
  national courts, decisions of 29
partial taking 167
relative infrequency of actions 268
termination of infringement 84
tests determining 28
  trade marks 101–3, 238–9
injunctions 4–5, 26
  final 78–9, 80, 81–2
  interim 5, 84, 85–6, 87
  post-expiry 77, 82
  reasonableness 77
  springboard 75–8
  transaction costs 83
  UK compared to US 80–81

intellectual property (IP) law
see also copyright; inventions; patents; trade marks
creation of scheme of duties as opposed to rights
29
damages, entitlement of owners to claim
75, 83
description of colour by reference to (trade marks) 27–8
economic justifications underpinning
46
enforcement 74–5
intangible abstract objects of IPRs 54
no rivalry in the consumption of intellectual goods 179
public power of intellectual property 11
rights and remedies of owners 74
rules, infrequently encountered 19
shareability of information 180
terminology 27
Intellectual Property Office, UK, Trade Marks Manual 115
interim injunctions 5, 84, 85–6, 87
internet 182–3
interpersonal/social dimension 178–256
and rivalry 179
inventions
see also patents; priority dates, patents/inventions
compensation, entitlement of employee to 38–9, 41
concept of invention 135, 151
degree of novelty or difference from the prior art 159
exclusions 135
experimentation, product of 59, 60, 62
fair share of benefit, employee inventions 38–9
industrially applicable condition 151
inventive step requirement 34, 59–60, 97, 151, 153, 159, 160, 166
morality issues, and bias 117
novelty requirement 34, 35
obviousness test see obviousness test, inventions
prior art see prior art
requirement of inventiveness 153
simple facts 34
software-implemented, patentability 130, 132
and state of the art 33
technical character 131, 135, 136–7, 139
tests 153
whether patentable under the terms of the EPC 29
judicial activism, limits 187–8
judicial discretion see discretion, judicial
justifications underpinning intellectual property law 257–92
economic 18, 46
research and development (R&D), investment in 21, 258–61
theories 267
trade marks 262–3
Kajon, M 258
Kant, Immanuel 23, 190, 284–9
individualism 287–9
Kelman, Mark 188–9
Kennedy, Duncan 12, 35–6, 40, 180–82, 185–9, 253, 286–8
Kitchen, Sir David James 264
Klemperer, P 260, 273–5
Knight, Frank 259
Kozinski, Alex 233–4
Laddie, Sir Hugh Ian Lang 53, 62
laissez-faire theory 186
Lalande, Michel-Richard de 162, 193, 194, 199
Landes, W 82, 201, 206–7, 211, 229, 230, 257, 261–5, 271
legal directions
content and scope 47
extraction for an earlier decision 47
morality conditions 111
Index

personal convictions, figuring in
decision making process 91
standards, framed as 93
wording of 32, 40
legislation
bias, avoiding perceptions of in
decision making 91, 105–24
creation of law by courts 30, 107
defined 32
European integration and
harmonization 91, 125–46
ex ante versus ex post decision
making 91, 92–105
legislative power and harmonization
89–146
limits on law-making powers 89
past decisions, unavailability of
107–8
patent law 58–9
Lemley, Mark 269, 272, 273, 274, 275
Lewison, Kim Martin Jordan 102–3
licences, compulsory 80–81
likelihood of confusion, trade marks 6,
101, 102, 103
literary works, originality 193, 200, 207
Llewellyn, Karl 125–6
Locke, John 283, 284
luxury goods 254–5
MacCormick, Neil 31, 32, 48, 63–4
Machlup, Fritz 291
MacMillan, Hugh (Baron) 196
Mansfield, E 258
Mansfield, William Murray
(eighteenth-century judge) 228
Medicines Patent Pool (MPP) 184
Merges, Robert 262, 272, 283, 284–9
Justifying Intellectual Property 23
misrepresentation 49–51
see also passing off, tort of
deceptive 51, 52
material 50
reappraisal of notion 52
reliance upon 50
monopoly-profit-incentive thesis 267,
281
morality issues, and bias 111–24
copyright 111–13
impartiality of judge 114
patents 117–18
surveys and opinion polls 121–2
trade marks 114–15
Munich Diplomatic Conference (2000)
69, 137, 141, 143
music, copying of 193, 194, 200, 204
Neuberger, David Edmond (Baron) 28,
65, 67, 78–80, 90, 108, 125,
129–30
novelty requirement, inventions 34, 35
protectable subject matter, defining
boundaries of 151, 159
tests 151
obiter dicta 47
obviousness test, inventions 25, 34, 42,
63, 223, 224, 227
see also inventions
ex ante versus ex post decision
making 94
and fairness 44
harmonization and integration,
European 140
‘obvious to try’ test 60, 61, 62, 64
protectable subject matter, defining
boundaries of 152–3, 154–5
requirement of non-obviousness 157
Office for Harmonisation in the Internal
Market (OHIM) 279
Boards of Appeal 116, 117
Guidelines 115
Oliver, Peter Raymond (Baron) 36, 49,
50, 53, 65, 157, 163, 198–201
open access movement 183
opinion polls 121–2
‘ordre public’, patents contrary to 117,
119, 120, 121
originality condition, copyright 148,
160–68, 190, 192, 270
see also copyright
computer programs 164, 165
and copying 163, 198, 199–200
creativity 195
databases 165
dispensing with 168
European law 220, 221
Information Society Directive 165
literary works 193, 200, 207
meaning 205
photographs 164, 165
‘rule-like’ nature 169
skill, labour and judgement 161–3, 166, 193, 194, 196–9, 201
UK test 165

Palmer, Tom 291
Parker, Hubert Lister (Baron) 35, 50
partial taking, copyright 10, 14, 37, 59, 72, 93, 165, 167, 168, 217, 219
passing off, tort of 25
see also misrepresentation
Australian law 66
celebrity endorsement 52, 53
classical trinity 49, 53
common law nature 48–9
goodwill 50, 53
‘Jif Lemon’ case 49, 53
misrepresentation 49–51
name choices and packaging, similarities in 51
own-brand products 51, 52
proof of relevant commercial activity 66
public perception 51
trade mark registration system 100
Patent Office see European Patent Office (EPO)
patents 14–16, 223–32
see also European Patent Convention (EPC); European Patent Office (EPO); inventions; novelty requirement, inventions; prior art; priority dates, patents/inventions
competitiveness of particular firm 58
concept of patentability 117
established characters 44–5
European system 29, 137–8
examination of applications in the UK 153
exclusion of discoveries from patentable subject matter 70
first-to-file approach 91, 98
goal of stimulating innovative activity 57
grant of letters patent 155
impact of UK’s probable exit from the EU 29
and individualism 191
insular nature of law 118
in terrorem effect of bad patents 274
interpretation problems versus classification 64
inventive concept 55
legislation 58–9
morality issues, and bias 117–18
‘obvious to try’ test 60, 61, 62, 64
‘ordre public’, contrary to 117, 119, 120, 121
person skilled in the relevant art 55, 56, 57, 59
post-grant matters, unitary patents 29
prejudices 56, 57
priority in patent claims 91
protectable subject matter, defining boundaries of 27, 147, 150–60, 170–74, 176
as registered rights 150–51
royalty payments 275
rule-based nature of substantive examination, in Europe 136–7
rule-bound decisions 136, 270
software-implemented inventions, patentability 130
statutory provisions 55
substantive examination, European 136, 137
unitary 29
US system 80–81, 269
validity 174
Patents Convention see European Patent Convention (EPC)
Penner, James 231
Philips, Jeremy 264
pipe corrosion, case law 60–61
piracy 183
plant biotechnology, case law 122, 124
Index

policies
  justification of judicial decisions 45
principles compared 40
weight dimension 40–41
Posner, R 82, 201, 206–7, 211, 229, 230, 257, 261–5, 271
post-expiry injunctions 77, 82
Pound, Roscoe 46
precedent doctrine see binding precedents
prejudices
  see also bias, decision making
  absence of rules 91
patent law 56, 57
Prescott, Peter (QC) 68, 69, 133, 134, 136
principles
  errors of principle, judicial decision-making 42, 43
  justification of judicial decisions 45
  policies compared 40
  principled decisions 55
  weight dimension 40–41
prior art 20–22, 126, 132, 153, 158, 170–72, 271–3, 277, 278
see also inventions; novelty requirement; patents
devices 152
documents 60
ex ante versus ex post decision making 97
legal adjudication 34, 35, 37, 55, 56, 60
and novelty 151, 159
priority dates, patents/inventions 36, 56, 157, 173, 174, 273
see also inventions; patents
date of filing of application 95
default position 95
earlier relevant applications 95, 96
establishing priority 97
ex ante versus ex post decision making 94, 95, 97
interpersonal/social dimension 224–6, 229
and Paris Convention 96
‘poisonous priority’ 96
rule-based determination 97, 268
and TRIPS Agreement 96
in United States 98
progressive model of property rights 261–2
promotional goodwill 53
protectable subject matter, defining boundaries of 147–77
copyright 27, 147–8, 160–70, 176
formal examinations 150
obscurity 136
patents 27, 147, 150–60, 170–74, 176
registration systems 150
tangible property 149
trade marks 27, 148–9, 174–6
public interest test, compulsory licences 80–81
Pumfrey, Nicholas Richard 68, 70, 130, 156, 209, 212, 213
reasonableness, injunctive relief 77
research and development (R&D) 21, 258–61
uncertainty 258, 259
Rich, Giles 276, 277, 278
rights
  allocation at work 72–3
  creation of scheme of duties as opposed to 29
  ownership, law relating to 72–3
tests determining claims to 28
bias 6, 91–2, 111
copyright law 215, 216, 221
deliberate taking of 85–6
justifications underpinning intellectual property law 260, 271, 273, 275–7, 280, 284
risk adverse individuals 58, 149, 272
versus uncertainty 259
rule-bound decisions 25
see also adjudication, legal; legislation; standard-bound decisions
absolute precision in drafting, necessity of 33
adoption of general rules at supra-national level 7, 125–6
and arbitrary decisions 109
bias, avoiding perceptions of 106–7
choice between rules and no rules 89, 91
clarity and predictability characteristics 26–7, 36, 45, 136
and codification 125–6
coexistence of rules with standards 26
comparison of rules with principles and policies 40
comparison of rules with standards 2, 26, 35–6, 37, 45, 92
concepts 30–31
copyright 148, 219, 222–3, 248
deliberate taking of risk 85–6
ex ante versus ex post decision making 94
formulation of the rule as a rule 32
ideal rules 30, 90, 136
impossibility of perfect rules 90
individualism 188, 189, 203
inflexibility of 46–7, 71
infrequent occurrence of rules in intellectual property law 19
interim injunctions 84, 85–6, 87
inventions 151
legislative provisions formulated as rules 32–3
limits on law-making powers 89
originality condition, copyright 148
over- or under-inclusiveness as to purpose 46
patents 136, 270
prejudice, in absence of rules 91
priority dates 96, 97, 268
recognition of rule as binding by courts 32
rules versus standards debate 1, 26, 30–31, 35–6, 46, 91, 185
source of binding rules 32
trade marks 248
undesirable outcomes 47

Schlag, Pierre 26
Schwartz, N 258
Senftleben, M 241
Shapiro, C 272
Sherman, B 100, 118, 120, 149, 160, 161–2, 178, 213
similarity test copyright 167
trade marks 6, 11, 101–3, 175, 176, 244
skill, labour and judgement 161–3, 166, 196–9
copying of work 193, 194, 198, 201
copyright infringement 206–7
Social Darwinism 187
social psychology studies 182
software-implemented inventions, patentability 130, 132
Spence, M 46, 54
Spencer, Herbert 276
springboard injunctions 75–8
standard-bound decisions see also adjudication, legal; bias, decision making; rules
administration costs, increasing 46
adoption of standard at supra-national level 7, 125
altruism 13, 203
assessment of confusion, in trade mark cases 101
assessment of facts 35–6
and codification 125
coexistence of standards with rules 26
coherecne requirement 44, 45
comparison of standards with factors 38
comparison of standards with rules 2, 27, 35–6, 37, 45, 92
discretion, exercise of 36
economic efficiency 93
efficiency considerations 46
errors of principle, appealing of decisions 42, 43
ex ante versus ex post decision making 93, 94
flexibility and dynamism requirements 27, 45, 47
and foresight 5–6
Index

foresight requirement 105
interim injunctions 84, 85–6, 87
legal directions framed as 93
limits on law-making powers 89
negligence 42
principles 40
priority in patent claims 91
reference by appellate courts to standards 42
rules versus standards debate 1, 26, 30–31, 35–6, 46, 84, 91, 185
uncertainty up to point when decision made 150
standards of conduct 72
state of the art, inventions 33, 34
statutory provisions
effect on legal adjudication 31–2
imprecise language 32–3
substantial taking, copyright 13, 72, 169, 190, 206, 211, 213, 221
Sunstein, Cass 1, 30, 32, 33, 35–41, 46, 47, 71, 86, 89, 92, 106, 125, 182
Supreme Court, UK 65, 108
surveys 121–2

technical character, patents/inventions 131, 135, 136–7, 139
territory, right of property owners to exclude others from 29–30
Trade Mark Register 279, 280
trade marks 10–11, 17–18, 22, 232–56
brand extension 237–8
colour, registration as a trade mark 27–8
Commission reform proposals 246
double identity 239
established characters 44–5
ex ante versus ex post decision making 99–105
exclusive rights provided to owners 17
fair competition 247–8
form and substance, correspondence between 191
functions 244–5, 250–51

graphic representation requirement 28
grounds for refusing registration 27, 100, 101, 104–5, 175
identity 10, 149, 175, 191, 239, 240, 241, 244, 248, 251, 254, 256, 282
and individualism 191
information systems and networking 252–3
informed choice 255
infringement claims 101–3, 238–9
keywords 242
likelihood of confusion 6, 101, 102, 103
luxury goods 254–5
morality issues, and bias 114–15
network effects 280
owners’ rights versus claimed rights to free use 235–6
protectable subject matter, defining boundaries of 27, 148–9, 174–6
public policy, contrary to 116
registration system 27, 100–101
rule-bound decisions 248
similarity test 6, 11, 101–3, 103, 175, 176, 244
Soviet Union, representation of the coat of arms 116
sports clubs and associations 236–7, 240
statutory defences to infringement claims 238–9
ubiquitous nature of 233
trusts, non-express 72
uncertainty 46, 54, 67, 82, 84, 150, 259–62, 269, 274–8
patents or inventions 152, 153, 273, 278
reducing 19, 21, 22, 265, 266, 267
research and development (R&D) 258, 259
and rights 262
versus risk 259
validity 266, 273, 278
unconscionability 4, 72, 74
### Form in intellectual property law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>United States</th>
<th>Vaver, David 80, 265</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>America Invents Act (AIA) 91, 98 compared to United Kingdom 80–81 first-to-invent scheme, priority determination 91 patents 80–81, 269 priority dates, patents/inventions 98</td>
<td>Wagner, S 258 Waldron, Jeremy 197, 215 Wendell Holmes, Oliver 203 White, Alan 223 Younger, Judge 111–13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>