Index

actiones exercitoria/institoria 22
affirmative asset partitioning 7
Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA) 145, 174
agency costs 35
agency law 74
corporations as principals of their employee-agents 44–5
general rules of agency 87, 89
Aktiengesellschaft (AG), German public limited company 259, 260
Alexander, Janet Cooper 71
Alexander I (Emperor of Russia) 25
alter ego doctrine 143, 186
see also veil-piercing standards
alter ego plus 86, 96, 97–101
in Canada 246
case law 87–9
in Ohio 94–7
"personal ends" of shareholders versus "corporate ends" 87, 88, 89
shortcomings 45
veil piercing, statutory contexts 167, 168
Walkoversky approach 87–9, 90
whether resulting in direct or vicarious liability/whether important 93–4
why control alone insufficient to pierce corporate veil 91–3
American Civil War 31
Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) 145, 174
Ames, Samuel 21, 31, 35, 38, 39, 40
Angell, Joseph K. 21, 31, 35, 38, 39, 40
anti-capitalist movement 3
applicable law
see also choice of law
choice of law in state law cases 133–6
important cases
Soviet Pan Am Travel Effort v. Travel Committee, Inc. (1991) 135–6, 141
Kimball Foods test 137, 138–9
law or equity 142–4
underlying claim based on federal law 136–40
United States 132–3, 136–40
veil piercing and contractual choice of law provisions 140–41
arbitrage, statutory 148–51
asset lock-in 7
at-will partnership 7
Australia and New Zealand, veil piercing in 242–4
automobile driving 74
bankruptcy 8, 11, 50, 60, 72
Bankruptcy Code, US 163, 182, 189
banks/bank shareholders 39, 40, 48–9
Berle, Adolf 193–4
Bhopal disaster, Union Carbide 228
Blackstone, William 19–20, 21
Blumberg, Phillip 51–2
British Petroleum (BP) 10, 76
Bubble Act (1720), UK 29
burden of proof, veil piercing 103–5
California, US 74, 100
alter ego plus 97, 100
limited liability system 40–42
Canada, veil piercing in 244–51
alter ego doctrine 246

305
Limited liability

B.G. Preeco (Pacific Coast) Ltd. v. Bon Street Holdings Ltd. (1989) 249, 250

Transamerica doctrine 250
canals, British 29, 30
capitalism 1–2
anti-capitalist movement 3
CERCLA see Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act (CERCLA)
certiorari 269–70
charters 21, 28, 30
cheapest cost avoider principle 79
China
capitalism in 2
defective liquidation procedures 272
evaluation 272–4
limited liability 267–9
New Company Law statute 267–8, 269, 272, 273
Supreme People’s Court 270, 271
unauthorized capital transactions 271, 271–2
veil piercing 269–70
vertical and horizontal piercing 270–71
choice of law
see also applicable law
contractual provisions, and veil piercing 140–41
federalism 159–62
labor relations 161
lower courts 159
state law cases 133–6
veil piercing, statutory contexts 158–63
Chrysler 12
Civil Rights Act (1964) 145
close/closely held corporations 53
compared to public corporations 78
contract creditors of 11, 77–81
line-drawing problem 78, 83
tort creditors of 12, 81–5
Code de Commerce, nineteenth-century France (1807) 26, 53, 254
collegia 21
colonialism, United States 32–6
commenda (form of contract) 23, 24
commendator (passive investor) 24
Commercial Code, Napoleonic France (1807) 26, 53, 254
commercial misrepresentation, contract creditors 284–7
commingling of assets doctrine
France 256–7
Germany 260–61
commingling of assets doctrine, France 253
comparative perspectives, limited liability 234–78
see also comparative perspectives, veil piercing
China 267–9
France 26–7, 252
Germany 259–60
Japan 274–8
United Kingdom 236–7
comparative perspectives, veil piercing
Australia and New Zealand 242–4
Canada 244–51
China 269–71
vertical and horizontal piercing 270–71
France 252–8
Germany 260–63
Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act (CERCLA) 12, 77, 136, 148, 154
concession theory 2, 68
continental practice, nineteenth century 25–7
contract creditors
of close corporations 11, 77–81
commercial misrepresentation 284–7
defined 56
ex post undercapitalization 287–9
on guarantees for debts 14
and joint and several liability 61, 64–6
and limited liability 11
nature of claim 115
and other bargain settings 283–9
of public corporations 10, 11, 56–66
contractarian theory 54–6
Index

contractual choice of law, and veil piercing 140–41
convertible debt securities 50
corporate charters, England 30
Corporate Law Code (AktG), Germany 263–4
Corporate Laws Committee, American Bar Association (Business Law Section) 9
corporate separateness 4, 5, 21, 243
The Corporation: The Pathological Pursuit of Profit and Power (documentary) 3
corporations capital raising 33
close see close corporations
complex, ethics of imposing personal liability in 46–7
dissolution 8
formation costs 33–4
key features 2, 13
large see large corporations
layered 119
multiple, splitting business into 87, 88
origins 1
parent-subsidiary or sibling 118–20, 293–301
as principals of their employee-agents 44–5
public see public corporations société anonyme resembling 26
in United States 13, 31, 132
cost–benefit analysis (CBA) 49, 228, 289
courts likelihood to pierce in statutory cases 179–80
lower courts 157–8, 159
Supreme Court 151–7, 190–3
creditors see also contract creditors; tort creditors
and bankruptcy situations 11
comparative advantages over passive shareholders 60
entity shielding 8
involuntary 49, 50, 55
risks shifted to 47
secured 72
unsecured 189
voluntary 9, 50, 55, 230
debt covenants 11
Deepwater Horizon oil spill (2010) 10, 76
default risk 48
default rules see also majoritarian default, limited liability as bargaining out of 80, 83
charters 26, 28
content 55
corporate law 58–9, 63
information-forcing 230
limited liability 16, 32, 52, 77, 78, 83, 85, 226, 234, 252, 283
partnership law 14, 56, 58, 61
standard form contracts 17–18, 56
defendant, nature of see also veil-piercing standards
active versus passive shareholders 120–21
joint and several liability for multiple shareholders 121–2
parent-subsidiary or sibling corporations 118–20
shareholders of public corporations 117–18
whether non-shareholder can be held liable on a veil-piercing theory 123–4
Delaware General Corporation Law (DGCL), and corporate separateness 5
democracy, populist 52–3
Department of Labor, US 170, 173, 174, 175, 176, 177
dissolution, administrative 8
doctrine of appearance for corporate groups, France 253, 257–8
Dodd, E. Merrick 51–2
Dooley, Michael 76
double liability, US 38, 40
driving 74
Limited liability

East India Company 27
Easterbrook, Frank 130, 228
Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA) 94, 138, 151, 178
enterprise liability 12, 191–8
Germany 263–6
growth of 15
important cases
Gartner v. Snyder (1979) 195
Macrodyne Indus., Inc. v. State Board of Equalization (1987) 196
Pan Pacific Sash & Door Co. v. Greendale Park, Inc (1958) 195–6, 197
law of 195–8
limited liability companies, involving 221
and parent-subsidiary corporations 293–301
versus piercing the corporate veil 194–5
putative origins 193–4
entity shielding 7–9, 33
entrepreneurs 31, 47
Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), US 170, 172
environmental statutes 170–73
equitable subordination doctrine 28
ex ante bargaining 10, 11
exceptions to limited liability 3, 16–17
ex post undercapitalization, contract creditors 287–9

federalism 34
fictitious company doctrine, France 253, 255–6
Fischel, Daniel 228
forward veil piercing 182
France
asset insufficiency proceeding 253–4
Bankruptcy Statute 253
Commercial Code (1807) 26, 53, 254
commingling of assets doctrine 253, 256–7
Corporate Protection Act (2005) 253
debt obligation proceeding 254
document of appearance for corporate groups 253, 257–8
equitable veil-piercing doctrines 255–8
fault of directors 253–4
fictitious company doctrine 253, 255–6
limited liability 26–7, 252
small limited liability company (SARL) 252
veil-piercing doctrines 252–8
fraud 26, 34, 112–13, 117
comparative perspectives 247, 248
free riders 62

Germany
Corporate Law Code (AktG) 263–4
disregard of corporate formalities 261
enterprise liability 263–6
Konzern (concern) 263–4, 265
limited liability 259–60
undercapitalization 261–3
veil piercing 260–63
Gesellschaft mit beschränkter Haftung (GmbH), German private limited company 259, 260
Glynn, Timothy 194–5
Green, Ronald M. 66, 67–8
Grundfest, Joseph 71
Gulf Oil spill (2010) 10, 76

Hamilton, Bob 57
Hansmann, Henry 42–3, 70–75, 225
Hawes, Colin 271, 273, 274
Hirschman, Albert 58
history of limited liability
ancient roots 21–3
continental practice, nineteenth century 25–7
in England 27–31
historical development 19–20
historical evidence 51–2
important cases
Edmunds v. Brown and Tillard (1668), UK 27–8
Salmon v. Hamborough Co. (1671), UK 30, 37
Index

Slee v. Bloom (1822), US 37, 38
medieval Europe 23–4
Roman law 20
in United States 31–43
Hovenkamp, Herbert 37, 69
Huang, Hui 272
hypothetical bargain 54, 55, 56, 65–6, 69, 77, 79, 85

Illinois, US 97
incorporation costs 33–4
Industrial Revolution 29
and United States 36–8
insider reverse veil piercing 187
instrumentality test 86, 100–102
interest rate manipulation 50
Internal Revenue Code 149, 150
involuntary creditors 49, 50, 55

Japan, limited liability 274–8
Jefferson, Thomas 2
joint and several liability 39, 40
and contract creditors of public corporations 61, 64–6
multiple shareholders 121–2
Joint Stock Companies Act (1856), UK 29
Joint Stock Companies Registration, Incorporation and Regulation Act (1844), UK 31
joint-stock companies 25, 29, 30
judges 281

kabushiki kaisha (KK), stock corporation 275
Kimball Foods test 137, 138–9
Kraakman, Reinier 42–3, 70–75, 225

labor statutes 173–9
see also workers’ rights
large corporations
see also public corporations
and default rules of corporate law 58–9
growth of extremely large corporations 14–15
torts committed by 12
lawyers 4
legal personhood 5–6, 45, 302
levitation principle 30, 37
liability
attachment at time of judgment 72
direct or vicarious 93–4, 283
enterprise 191–8
joint and several see joint and several liability
limited see limited liability
several 39
unlimited see unlimited liability
limited liability 9–13
see also limited liability corporations (LLCs); unlimited liability: veil piercing; veil piercing, statutory contexts
absolute 40
as bargain-forcing rule 80–81
comparative perspectives see comparative perspectives, limited liability
as consequence of corporate personhood 44–5
corporate separateness 4, 5, 21, 243
critics 3
default rules 16, 32, 52, 77, 78, 83, 85, 226, 234, 252, 283
entity shielding 7–9, 33
ethics of imposing personal liability in complex organizations 46–7
ex ante bargaining 10, 11
exceptions 3, 16–17
as expression of populist democracy 52–3
historical evidence 51–2
see also history of limited liability
importance of doctrine 2, 13–15, 293
as inducement for risk 47–52
legal personhood 5–6, 45, 302
as majoritarian default 53–85
negative externalities 49
reform proposals 282–3
relevant cases/benefits 11–13
and shareholders see shareholders and sovereign immunity 20, 25
Limited Liability Act (1855), UK 29, 236
limited liability company veil piercing 18

see also limited liability corporations (LLCs); veil piercing; veil-piercing standards; veil piercing, statutory contexts affirmative case for, examining 223–9 case against 229–32

limited liability corporations (LLCs) 19, 43, 200–233


Stone v. Frederick Hobby Assoc. II (2001) 219

Tom Thumb Food Markets, Inc. v. TLH Properties, LLC (1999) 204

limited liability company statutes and piercing question 203–12

North Dakota LLC statute 205–6 numbers in US 200–201 policy 221–32 seminal case 212–15 limited liability partnerships (LLPs) 14, 19, 24, 43 société en commandite resembling 26 line-drawing problem, close corporations 78, 83 liquidation procedures, defective 272 liquidity considerations 33, 72 LLCs see limited liability corporations (LLCs) LLPs see limited liability partnerships (LLPs) Loewenstein, Mark 125 LoPucki, Lynn 293–6, 298, 300 Macey, Jonathan 39–40, 110, 128 Maine, Massachusetts 37 majoritarian default, limited liability as 53–85 contract creditors of close corporations 77–81 contract creditors of public corporations 56–66 contractarian theory 54–6 hypothetical bargain 54, 55, 56, 65–6, 69, 77, 79, 85 tort creditors of close corporations 81–5 tort creditors of public corporations 66–77 unlimited liability 57, 59, 61, 62, 63–4 Marshall, John 27 Massachusetts, industrialization 36, 37
Index

Matheson, John 179–80
medieval Europe, limited liability in 23–4
Miller, Geoffrey 39–40
Miller, Sandra 266
misrepresentation 81, 284–7
Mitchell, Lawrence 52
Mitts, Joshua 110, 128
Model Business Corporation Act (MBCA) 9, 16, 117, 282
monopolies 29
multi-factor versus purpose tests 163–6, 237
Murray, Nicholas 2, 19

National Labor Relations Board, US 173
National People’s Congress, China 267
nautilcum fenus (Roman sea loan) 22–3, 28
New England, industrialization 36, 37
New Hampshire 37
New York Act (1811) 37, 38
Novak, Michael 232
Numa Pompilius 21

Occupy Wall Street movement 3
Oh, Peter 100, 104, 111, 112, 116, 119
outsider reverse veil piercing 187–90

 paramount interest test 135, 156
parent-subsidiary corporations
and enterprise liability 293–301
and veil piercing 118–20
partnership law 7–8, 14, 60
default rules 14, 56, 58, 61
“jingle rule” 188–9
limited liability partnerships 14, 19, 24, 43
peculium (Roman legal device) 22, 23, 28

personal liability
ethics of imposing in complex organizations 46–7
of shareholders 16–17
and tort creditors of public corporations 72–3
and veil piercing 14, 16–17
personhood
corporate 44–5
legal 5–6, 45
piercing the corporate veil see limited liability corporations (LLCs); veil piercing; veil-piercing standards; veil piercing, statutory contexts

Plutarch 21
Pompilius (Numa) 21
populist democracy, limited liability as expression of 52–3
Posner, Richard A. 61, 169, 172
Presser, Stephen 52, 231
principals, in agency law 44–5, 74
prohibition 270
public corporations
compared to close corporations 78
contract creditors 10, 11, 56–66
shareholders 117–18
tort creditors 11–12, 66–77
railroads 30
transcontinental 15
real estate investment trust (REIT) 298, 299
Reed, Bradley 274
res publica 20, 21
Restatement (Second) of Conflicts of Law, drafters 134
retail investors 59–60
reverse veil piercing 181–91
important cases
Cargill, Inc. v. Hedge (1985) 182–6
Domino’s Pizza, Inc. v. McDonald (2006) 190–91
Taurus IP, LLC v. DaimlerChrysler Corp (2013) 190
outsider 187–90
in Supreme Court 190–93
Ribstein, Larry 13, 57, 200, 201, 230
risks/risk-taking 3, 4, 40
see also entrepreneurs
default risk 48
encouraging 51
externalization 227, 281
limited liability as inducement for 47–52
litigation 72
and return 47
tort creditors 74
volatility risk 48
Roman law 20, 22–3, 28
Russia 25–6
sea loan (Roman law) 22–3, 28
sea voyages 24, 29
secured creditors 72
separate corporate personality see corporate separateness
several liability 39
shareholders
see also veil piercing
active versus passive 120–21
bank shareholders 39, 40, 48–9
close corporations 78
joint and several liability for multiple shareholders 121–2
liability of 16–17, 39
and limited liability 9, 11
monitoring of 35, 75
and veil piercing 117–18, 120–21
whether non-shareholder can be held liable on a veil-piercing theory 123–4
shares, and limited liability 33
social costs 64–5
societates (Roman associations) 21, 22, 27
société anonyme (French business firm type) 26, 27, 28, 252
société en commandite (French business firm type) 26–7, 34
sovereign immunity, and limited liability 20, 25
standard of proof, veil piercing 103–5
state-chartered companies 28, 29
statutory veil piercing see veil piercing, statutory contexts
Strine, Leo 75
subordination, equitable 28
Thatcher, Margaret 238
Thompson, Robert 84, 99–100, 111, 116, 179
Thurlow, Edward (First Baron) 5
tort creditors 289–92
of close corporations 12, 81–5
equity cushion, dependence on 72
of public corporations 11–12, 66–77
tort victims 9, 47, 50, 70
compensation for 73, 290
potential 77, 298
tractator (manager) 24
trade guilds 27
transaction costs 48, 54
unauthorized capital transactions 271
undercapitalization
ex post 287–9
Germany 261–3
standing alone 126–9
Uniform Partnership Act (UPA) of 1914 14, 56, 57, 64, 188
of 1996 189
of 1997 14, 56, 57, 60, 189
Union Carbide, Bhopal disaster 228
United Kingdom
limited liability in 236–7
history of limited liability 27–31
single-entity theory 242
veil-piercing doctrine 237–42
Adams v. Cape Industries plc (1990) 239–40
Salomon v. Salomon (1897) 236, 238, 239, 249
Smith, Stone and Knight v. Birmingham (1939) 237–8, 244
United States 2
see also California, US
alter ego doctrine in Ohio 94–7
applicable law 18, 132–3, 136–40
Bankruptcy Code 163, 182, 189
corporate and bankruptcy law 8
corporations in 13, 31, 132
current position of limited liability 39–40
Department of Labor 170, 173, 174, 175, 176, 177
Environmental Protection Agency 170, 172
history of limited liability 31–43, 51
California experience 40–42
colonial experience 32–6
Industrial Revolution 36–8
inheriting of English law 32, 35
Ohio, alter ego in 94–7
reform proposals 42–3
Supremacy Clause, Constitution 150
Supreme Court precedents, veil piercing 151–7
universitates 21
unlimited liability 43, 48
see also limited liability
and contract creditors of public corporations 57, 59, 61, 62, 63–4
and tort creditors of public corporations 71–2
unsecured creditors 189
Vanderkerckhove, Karen 254, 258
veil piercing
see also limited liability
comparative perspectives see comparative perspectives, veil piercing
definition/purpose 3
versus enterprise liability 194–5
forward 182
as legal or equitable doctrine 142–4
limited liability corporation (LLC) 223–9
and personal liability 14, 16–17
rethinking 279–301
reverse 181–91
risks 4
standards see veil-piercing standards
statutory contexts see veil piercing, statutory contexts
uncertainty/unpredictability 4
in unincorporated entities see limited liability corporations (LLCs)
vertical and horizontal piercing (China) 270–1
veil piercing, in unincorporated entities see limited liability corporations (LLCs)
veil-piercing standards 86–131
see also veil piercing, statutory contexts
alter ego doctrine see alter ego doctrine
breadth of 166–9
burden and standard of proof 103–5
common factors and considerations 102–29
and contractual choice of law provisions 140–41
critique 129–31
fraud 112–13
important cases
Associated Vendors, Inc. v. Oakland Meat Co. (1962) 105, 106
Dewitt Truck Brokers, Inc. v. W. Ray Flemming Fruit Co. (1976) 103
Evanston Ins. Co. v. Lako (1989) 123
Lally v. Catskill Airways Inc. (1993) 123–4
Minton v. Cavaney (1961) 128–9
Riddle v. Leuschner (1959) 124
Limited liability

Zaist v. Olson (1967) 100–102
instrumentality test 86, 100–102
laundry list 105–11, 237
most important factors 111–12
nature of claim 115–17
nature of defendant see defendant, nature of
shareholders see shareholders
undercapitalization 126–9
whether non-shareholder can be held liable on a veil-piercing theory 123–4
why control alone insufficient to pierce corporate veil 91–3
wrongs, other 113–15
veil piercing, statutory contexts 145–8
see also veil-piercing standards
alter ego doctrine 167, 168
background 145–6
breadth of veil-piercing standard 166–9
choice of law 158–63
environmental statutes 170–3
federalism 159–62
important cases
Anderson v. Abbott (1944) 151–2, 153, 155, 156, 169
Edwards Co. v. Monogram Industries (1983) 168
Engelhardt v. S.P. Richards Co., Inc. (2006) 177
Erie Railroad Co. v. Tompkins (1938) 150–2, 158
Medtronic, Inc. v. Lohr (1996) 147
Nesbit v. Gears Unlimited, Inc. (2003) 177
New Colonial Ice Co. v. Helvering (1934) 153
Schenley Distillers Corp. v. U.S. (1946) 153
U.S. v. Jon-T Chemical, Inc (1985) 167
U.S. v. Peters (2013) 162
labor statutes 159–60, 173–9
legislative authority and judicial interpretation 147–8
likelihood of courts to pierce in statutory cases 179–80
limited company statutes and piercing question 203–12
lower court opinions 157–8, 159
multi-factor versus purpose tests 163–6, 237
specific contexts 169–79
statutes invoking piercing 203–8
statutes silent on piercing 208–12
statutory arbitrage, issue of 148–51
Supreme Court precedents 151–7
underlying statute 162
vicarious liability 93–4, 283
Virginia, US 97–8, 99, 100
volatility risk 48
voluntary creditors 9, 50, 55, 230
enterprise liability 191–2, 198, 293
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Index</strong></th>
<th>315</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>and tort creditors of public corporations 82–3</td>
<td>Worker Adjustment Retraining and Notification Act (WARN Act) 176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>veil-piercing standards 87–9, 90, 126, 128</td>
<td>workers' rights 292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>veil piercing, statutory contexts 146, 148</td>
<td>Wright, Robert 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West, Mark 58</td>
<td>Wu, Mark 273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zero transaction costs 48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>