Index

academic scholarship
China cases deep study phase 191–3
DSU deep study phase 188–91
DSU introductory phase 186–8
amicus briefs 11
Sutherland Report on 13
Appellate Body (AB)
appeals process in DSU 31–2
applicable law see applicable law
before WTO disputes settlement body
burden of proof, inconsistencies in
allocating 18–19
deference 13
economic reasons to appeal 34
factual findings not subject to review 33
greater use of dispute mechanism by
broader WTO membership 32–5, 36
issues of law, appeals on 33, 35
jurisdiction 33
competence de la compétence
principle 60–61
length of time for appeals 33–4
member’s confidence in 33, 35
numbers of appeals 32
references to international law
practices 13–14
applicable law before WTO disputes
settlement body 41–62
applicable law in dispute settlement 47–9
jurisdiction of DSU 48–9, 64
consent as key element in formation of
WTO law 41–2
customary international law as
source of WTO law 53–7
customary international law
central to interpreting WTO agreements 55
other customary international law
rules 56–7
remedies and customary
international law 56
treaty interpretation 53, 55
WTO law and international law 56
general principles of law 57–61
AB and panels, and 59–60
estoppel 58–9
risk of over-reliance on 58–9
secondary source of law, as 57–8
sources of law, as 57, 60
sources of WTO law, as 60
weaknesses 60
when applied 58
purposes of WTO dispute settlement
system 43–6
sources of public international law/
trade law 41–3, 47
conflict rules 43
determining existence of dispute,
importance of 44
ICJ, and 47, 48
no clear specification of sources
of WTO law 42
state consent 43
text of WTO covered agreements:
straightforward sources 49–53
covered agreements as primary
source of WTO law 49, 51–3
international law, panels and AB
considering 50–51, 64
primary obligations, AB/panels
determining if measures
consistent with 51–2
Association of South East Asian
Countries (ASEAN) 17
audio-visual products 160–66
automobile parts imports 119–25, 131
The political economy of WTO implementation

Bali 2013 Package (trade facilitation/food security) 9, 10
Bank of International Settlement 63
BRICS economies 1, 15
burden of proof 18–19

China
climate change 199
compliance see Confucianism and compliance
Confucianism see Confucianism
DSU see China and WTO dispute settlement system
economy, size of 202
foreign exchange reserves, holding world’s largest 2
GDP, growth in 199
globalisation, implications of 91
history 198–9
human rights 199–200
internal economic liberalisation 2
law, approach to 91–4
Confucianism, and see Confucianism
civil codes 92
criminal codes 92, 93
disputes disruptive to harmony 93–4
informal settlements preferred 93–4
resolved by mutual concessions 93
idea of law, origins of 92
instrument of last resort, as 93
perception of law as evil 93
purpose of law as punishment 92, 94
reluctance to be bound by Western customary law 198
rule of law 2, 91, 93, 94, 185–6
perception of itself 198
regulatory and institutional reforms 2
world trade, increased share of 2
WTO, joining 1, 2
accession negotiation to current commitments 95–107
assessment of China’s accession to WTO 101–6

commitment of Chinese government to fulfil obligations 106–7
history of China’s accession 1, 2, 95–101
positive response from international/national media 101–6

China and WTO dispute settlement system 2, 94, 108–93
Chinese practice within WTO dispute settlement framework 108–78
astonishing beginning as a complainant: steel industry safeguards 108–12
diplomat within first five years 112–78
compliance, challenge of 153–78
Chinese cultural industries, threat to 160–66
copyright law, amendment of 153–60
credit cards/logos 166–74
hard case to implement: oriented electrical steel 174–8
compliance with DSB’s recommendation 200–201
diplomat within first five years, China as 112–78
challenge of compliance 153–78
difficulties faced by China 131, 153
first outing as respondent: automobile parts imports 119–25, 131
predictable dispute: value-added tax on integrated circuits 112–18, 131
revisiting issue of subsidies 125–32
WTO Chinese years 133–53
DSU rule-oriented system challenging traditional Chinese beliefs 91
factors in initiating dispute settlement procedure 185
number of cases 1, 15, 108, 133, 153, 182–3
perspectives on China and WTO dispute settlement system 178–93
academic scholarship: China cases deep study phase 191–3
academic scholarship: DSU introductory phase 186–8
academic scholarship: DSU deep study phase 188–91
Chinese Government’s perspective 178–86
recognition of importance of dispute settlement mechanism 184–6
preparatory work on dispute settlement system
acquiring knowledge about the system 178–83
cases, participating in 180, 182–3
litigation skills, developing 181, 182, 183, 185
rule-creation, participation in 180, 184, 185–6
third party, involvement as 180
WTO Chinese years 133–53
to be or not to be: financial information services 133–7
tough negotiation in renewable energy generation sector 145–53
war over resources in economic crisis: export of raw materials 137–45
China and WTO law: accession negotiation to current commitments 95–107
assessment of China’s accession to WTO 101–6
positive response from international/national media 101–6
commitment of Chinese government to fulfil obligations 106–7
history of China’s accession to WTO 1, 2, 95–101
GATT, application to restore membership of WTO key to China’s economic success 2
climate change 199

competence de la compétence principle 60–61
compliance
China, by see compliance: China
Chinese Confucianism, and see Confucianism and compliance
compliance with WTO rulings based on objective need 200
GATT, compliance responsibilities resting with parties under 23–4
good faith 45, 59
national image, interests and business interests as vital components of 200
non-compliance 11–12, 204–5
remedies, and 36, 71–2
non-compliance, remedies for 8, 12, 35–40
world trade law 8
discourse and constructivism, and 72–81
WTO Dispute Settlement
Understanding/System 70
constructivism, and 72–81
major issue of concern, as 64–5
pacta sunt servanda 40, 49, 70
reputation costs, and 3, 40, 81–7
compliance: China
challenge of compliance 153–78
Chinese cultural industries, threat to 160–66
compliance panel 11
copyright law, amendment of 153–60
credit cards/logos 166–74
hard case to implement: oriented electrical steel 174–8
Confucianism and compliance 70, 194–201
advantages and disadvantages of sincerity 197
Chinese Confucianism in context 194–7
importance of sincerity 195–7
meaning of sincerity 196, 197
no concept of compliance 197
sincerity as fundamental issue 195
contemporary China and compliance 197–201
bilateral perspective, from 198
multilateral perspective, from 198–200
WTO perspective, from 200–201
DSB’s recommendations, compliance with 200–201
international agreements, China’s compliance with 198
international organisations, China’s compliance with
International Monetary Fund 199
United Nations Committee against Torture 200
UN Environment Program 199
World Bank 199
WTO dispute settlement system 200–201
Confucianism 2, 91
Analects 92
compliance, and see Confucianism and compliance
deep-rooted tradition in China 194
education, effective management through 93
forbearance, importance of 92–3
greatest source of normativity, as 88
harmony as political goal 92, 93
law necessary for uneducated people 92–3
notion of law in Confucian tradition/need to adapt 3, 15, 91
origins 92
persuasion and negotiations as central tenets 2–3, 70, 91, 177, 202–3, 203–4
rule of law, and 3
sanctions 202
sincerity and/or compliance, concept of 194–7
values as foundation of China’s cultural/legal tradition, 2, 15, 70, 91, 92
basis for norms of Chinese behaviour 92
Confucianism and compliance 70, 194–201
Chinese Confucianism in context 194–7
advantages and disadvantages of sincerity 197
importance of sincerity 195–7
meaning of sincerity 196, 197
no concept of compliance 197
sincerity as fundamental issue 195
contemporary China and compliance 197–201
bilateral perspective, from 198
multilateral perspective, from 198–200
WTO perspective, from 200–201
constructivism 3, 72–81, 202
balancing approach determining rights and duties of states 77–81
collective legitimisation of behaviour 73–4
ideas and norms influencing international relations 74–7
identity of actors as guiding principle of inter-state interactions 73, 74
international institutional regimes as important forums 72
law, nature of 74
nature of world trading system 73
world trade law compliance discourse, and 72–81
copyright law, Chinese amendments to 159
intellectual property rights protection, inadequacy of 146
piracy rates 145, 156
WTO dispute settlement system, and 153–60
credit cards 166–74
dual-currency/Union Pay credit cards 166–8
cultural industries, threat to Chinese 160–66
conflict of ideology between China/US 165
cultural security, importance of 165
global proliferation of US books/audio-visual products, effects of 164
customary international law application in WTO case law undeveloped 57
China reluctant to be bound by Western customary law 198
codification 52–3
few customs clearly operating in area of trade law 55
international norms, ingredients for creation of 53–4
persistent objector principle 54, 57
remedies, and 56
source of WTO law, as 53–7
customary international law central to interpreting WTO agreements 55
other customary international law rules 56–7
WTO law and international law 56
treaty interpretation 53, 55
defereence 13
dispute settlement mechanisms applicable law in dispute settlement 47–9
DSU see Dispute Settlement Understanding/System (DSU)
GATT see under GATT
good faith compliance 45, 59
importance of 22–3
inter-state cooperation, and 17, 43
dispute settlement in inter-state agreements 17–18, 20
purpose of dispute settlement 18, 20, 22–3
importance of peaceful settlement of disputes 16, 44, 201
procedural rules 20–21
right to veto dispute resolution bodies/reports 21
purpose of 45
future role of dispute settlement system, debate over 45–6
international/trade agreements 19–20, 22–3
relevance in international/trade agreements 16–20
activism 19
diplomatic resolution of disputes 20, 22
dispute, meaning of 16, 44
inconsistencies in interpretation of international treaties 18–19
peaceful settlement of disputes, endorsing 16, 44
proliferation of dispute settlement facilities 17
purpose of dispute settlement 19–20, 22–3
reasons for disputes 19
role/future role of dispute settlement 17–18, 20
remedies see remedies
Dispute Settlement Understanding/System (DSU) 2, 3, 20, 29, 71
activism/making sense of agreements 19
jurisprudential progressivism 55
agreement on importance of 12
amicus briefs 11
Sutherland Report on 13
Appellate Body see Appellate Body (AB)
applicable law see applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
arbitration procedures 11
China, and see China and WTO dispute settlement system
collective countermeasures 12
compliance 70
constructivism, and 72–81
major issue of concern, as 64–5
pacta sunt servanda 40, 49
reputation costs, and 3, 40, 81–7
defereence
panels and AB, and 13
standard of review, and 13
Sutherland Report on 13
disputes, meaning of 44
emerging economies participating in 1
establishment of 11
estoppel 58–9
evolution of see evolution of GATT/WTO dispute settlement system
GATT Art XX, inconsistencies in interpreting 18
good faith in initiating complaints/in procedures 59, 60
greater use by broader WTO membership 32–5, 36
numbers of disputes 44
jurisdiction 47–50
no adjudication on non-WTO issues 47, 64
‘non-violation’ and ‘situation’ complaints 47–8
over any dispute from any WTO agreement 29–30, 48–9
non-compliance with report 11–12 panels
appeals from 31–2
applicable law see applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
automatic right to resort to, members’ 31
compétence de la compétence principle 60–61
obligations under Art 11 interpreted broadly 34
rulings/recommendations, adoption of 31–2
terms of reference 50
precedent 11, 19
Sutherland Report on 13 preventive measures 12
promised reforms not moving forward 10–13
constructive ambiguity impeding progress 12
issues of potential concern 10, 11
questions over how two-tier system would operate 11
purposes of 30–31, 43–6
future role of dispute settlement system, debate over 45–6
role of dispute settlement system 45
remand 11
remedies 11, 12, 32
compensation 36–7
compliance, and 36, 71–2
divisions among members 12
meaningful incentives to comply, absence of 40
MFN basis, compensation awarded on basis of 36
negotiable remedies 12
non-compliance for 12
controversies on remedies for non-compliance 35–40
non-retroactive 34, 39–40, 82
remedy ex nunc outside acquis of WTO 40
retaliation 37
remedies regime as lex specialis 14
reputation costs 3, 40, 81–7
sanctions, need for threat of 39
suspension of concessions/other obligations 36, 37
Sutherland report on 14
review of DSU, agreement for 11, 12
role/scope of 18–19
rule-based system, DSU as 30–32, 91
appeal stage of process 31–2
automatic right to resort to panel process, members’ 31
compulsory nature of DSU 30
DSU guided by GATT 1994 provisions 31
‘institutionalised bargaining’, move away from 30
preserving balance of rights/obligations of WTO members 31
rule of law, DSU based on 91
sequencing 11–12
standards of review
de novo review 13
Sutherland Report on 13
total deference 13
-two-tier system 17, 43–4
Doha Development Round/trade talks 9, 10
decision-making by consensus 10
lack of progress 15
Doha Ministerial Conference 12
Doha Ministerial Declaration 12
dubio mitius 60
-economic crisis see financial/economic crisis
electrical steel, oriented 174–8
electronic payments 166–74
estoppel 58–9
evolution of GATT/WTO dispute settlement system 16–40
constructing more legalistic dispute settlement method under GATT 22–7
Index

compliance responsibilities resting with parties 23–4
shift from diplomacy to more legalistic system 24–5, 30
shortcomings in GATT system, need to remedy 26–7
suspension of concessions regime 25–6
trade protectionist policies, effect of 23
types of approach 22
controversies on remedies for non-compliance with DSB rulings 35–40
DSU as rule-based system 30–32
greater use of DSU by broader WTO membership 32–5, 36
relevance of dispute settlement mechanisms in trade agreements 16–20
resolving disputes ‘the GATT way’ 20–22
procedural rules 20–21
Uruguay Round package as agreed by WTO members 27–30
see also dispute settlement mechanisms; Dispute Settlement Understanding/System (DSU)
export of raw materials 137–45

financial/economic crisis (2008) 2
resources in context of economic crisis 137–45
financial information services 133–7
Fuller, Lon 74

GATT (1948–1994) 9
concerns about future of GATT 26–7
contracting parties appointing experts 9
dispute settlement structure 11, 17
codification of ‘customary practice’ 25
compliance as responsibility of contracting parties 23–4
consultations between contracting parties 23
diplomatic resolution of disputes 20, 22, 24–5, 30, 91
evolution of see evolution of GATT/WTO dispute settlement system
ICJ, and 21
legal proceedings, aversion to 23–4
more legalistic method, constructing 24–7, 30
‘non-violation’ and ‘situation’ complaints 47–8
‘nullification or impairment’ 23, 25
pragmatism/avoidance of legalism 21
problems with lack of proper/reliable structure 22
procedural uncertainty, early 21–2
resolving disputes ‘the GATT way’ 20–22
shortcomings in GATT system, need to remedy 26–7
inconsistencies in interpreting Art XX 18
nature of 28
remedies 20–21, 22, 25–6
flawed system of 36
remedy of last resort 25
retaliation 37
suspension of concessions 25–6
unilateral suspension of concessions 26
trade protectionist interest groups, and 23
violations of contracting parties’ rights and obligation 23
general principles of law 57–61
AB and panels, and 59–60
estoppel 58–9
risk of over-reliance on 58–9
secondary source of law, as 57–8
sources of law, as 57, 60
sources of WTO law, as 60
weaknesses 60
when applied 58
global governance 7
globalisation 7, 63
China, implications for 91
economic globalisation, effects/meaning of 8
influence on international trade rules 7, 8
meaning 7–8
trade liberalisation see trade liberalisation
WTO as integral part of 8, 203
good faith
DSU, and 59, 60
dispute settlement mechanisms, and 45, 59
initiating complaints/in procedures 59, 60
WTO treaty obligations and 37, 49
Haberler, Professor Gottfried 9
human rights, China’s compliance with 199–200
International Labour Organization norms/rules 199–200
ICSID
length of time for appeals 34
intellectual property see copyright law, Chinese
International Court of Justice 32
dispute, definition of 44
GATT disputes, and 21
length of time for appeals 33–4
sources of public international law (Art 38(1) Statute) 47, 48, 50
international economic law 3, 7
national legal systems, enmeshed in 8
respect for international norms linked to economic incentives 38–9
Sutherland Report, and 13
see also applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
International Labour Organization (ILO) 199–200
International Monetary Fund 28, 63
China’s compliance with obligations 198
international trade law see world trade law
International Trade Organization (ITO) 95
ITO Charter 95–6
International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (ITLOS) 48
Jackson, John 12
jura novit curia 14, 56
jus cogens 42, 50
Kant, Immanuel 38
legitimate expectation, loss of 20
less developed countries trade, development of 9
Leutwiler, Fritz 9
lex specialis, remedies regime as 14
locus standi 14, 56
mercantilism 71, 204
most favoured nation (MFN) compensation awarded on basis of 36
customary law, and 55
‘mutual disarmament’ principle 71, 204
North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) dispute settlement 17
length of time for appeals 34
pacta sunt servanda 40, 49, 70, 204
panels
appeals from 31–2
applicable law see applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
automatic right to resort to, members’ 31
competence de la compétence principle 60–61
defence 13
general principles of law, and 59–60
international law, considering 50–51, 64
obligations under Art 11 interpreted broadly 34
primary obligations, panels determining if measures consistent with 51–2
rulings/recommendations, adoption of 31–2
terms of reference 50
peaceful settlement of disputes importance of 16, 44, 201
international agreements endorsing 16, 44
Index

persistent objector principle 54, 57
precautionary principle 14, 56
precedent 11, 19
Sutherland Report on 13
protectionist market policies 23
remedies 20–21, 22
customary international law 56
DSU, under 11, 12, 32
compensation 36–7
compliance, and 36, 71–2
divisions among members 12
meaningful incentives to comply, absence of 40
MFN basis, compensation awarded on basis of 36
negotiable remedies 12
non-compliance for 12
controversies on remedies for non-compliance 35–40
non-retroactive 34, 39–40, 82
remedies regime as lex specialis 14
remedy ex nunc outside acquis of WTO 40
reputation costs 3, 40, 81–7
retaliation 37
sanctions, need for threat of 39
suspension of concessions/other obligations 36, 37
Sutherland report on 14
functions of 35
GATT, under 20–21, 22, 25–6
flawed system of 36
remedy of last resort 25
retaliation 37
suspension of concessions 25–6
unilateral suspension of concessions 26
notion of reparation in international law 39–40
sanctions, need for threat of 38
scepticism as to effectiveness of 81
renewable energy generation sector 145–53
reputation costs 3, 202
diminishing 40
essential tool to enhance compliance with trade rules, as 81–7
importance of 82
rational choice theory 81
reliability and reputation costs 83–4
reputation at level of world trade law, factors in 84–7
nature of treaties, and 87–8
domestic audiences 87, 88
reputation costs enhancing compliance with WTO law 87–8
res judicata 60
restitutio in integrum 14
Ricardo, David 38
Rousseau, Charles 41
rule of law
China, and 2, 91, 93, 94, 185–6
Confucianism, and 3
DSU based on 91
Seattle Ministerial Conference 11
sincerity
concept of 194–7
fundamental issue, as 195
importance of 195–7
meaning of 196, 197
Smith, Adam 38
Sobel, Joel 83–4
sources of public international/trade law 41–3, 47
conflict rules 43
customary international law as source of WTO law 53–7
customary international law central to interpreting WTO agreements 55
general principles of law 60
ICJ, and 47, 48
no clear specification of sources of WTO law 42
state consent 43
text of GATT/WTO as primary source of WTO law 49–53
treaty interpretation 53, 55
WTO covered agreements as primary source of WTO law 49, 51–3
sovereignty
China
accepting constraints on 199
compliance, and 200
debates on meaning of 65, 66–7
The political economy of WTO implementation

definitions of 66–7

evolving concept, as 66

intrusion by WTO into 203

rights and duties of states
determining extent of 80–81

trade openness putting state sovereignty at risk 65

traditional notion of concept 65–6, 71, 204

no longer tenable 67–8

WTO, and 69

state responsibility, law of 14

steel, oriented electrical 174–8

Stiglitz, Joseph 7

subsidies 125–32

Sutherland Report

composition of consultative board 8, 9
criticisms of 12, 13–14

DSU remedies regime as lex specialis 14

failure to implement

recommendations 10

publication of 9–10

reasons for establishing consultative board 10–11

role of consultative board 8–9

useful comments on relevant issues 13

theorising WTO implementation

regime 63–88

nature of treaties and reputation costs 87–8

reputation costs as essential tool to enhance compliance with trade rules 81–7

trade liberalisation as limitation of power of nation-state 63–72

world trade law compliance discourse and constructivism 72–81

Tokyo Round/Code 25

trade agreements

dispute settlement mechanisms in see under dispute settlement mechanisms

proliferation of 16

trade liberalisation

limitation of power of nation-state, as 63–72

WTO as engine for 7, 36, 37

Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) 146, 157

treaties

dispute settlement

inter-state agreements, in 17–18, 20

purpose of 18, 20, 22–3

interpretation under customary law 53, 55

logical source of international law for China 198

manifest error in formation of 14, 57

no retroactive application of 14, 56–7

reputation costs, nature of treaties and 87–8

successive treaties 56

ubi jus, ibi remedium 14

unilateral actions/unilateralism 68–9, 204

United Nations 28

United Nations Committee against Torture 200

United Nations Conference on Trade and Development 63


United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) 95

United Nations Environment Program 199

Uruguay Round 11, 27–30, 71, 204

utilitarianism 73

value-added tax on integrated circuits 112–18, 131

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

Art 60/multilateral retaliation 26

interpretation of treaties 55

Wendell Holmes Jr, Chief Justice Oliver 35

World Bank 28, 63

China’s compliance with obligations 198
Index

world trade law
changing fundamentals in global architecture, and 7–15
compliance
discourse and constructivism, and 72–81
international law obligations, with 8
remedies for non-compliance 8
see also compliance
consent as key element in formation of WTO law 41–2
customary international law as source of WTO law 53–7
few customs clearly operating in area of trade law 55
market opening as customary practice in international economic relations 54–5
globalisation, influence on international trade rules of 7, 8
growing intercourse between WTO rules/other international law rules 13–14
hard and soft law in international trade norm-making 8
importance of 8
international law, and 56
international law’s place in WTO’s acquis 13–14
reputation costs see reputation costs
sources of trade law 41–3, 47
conflict rules 43
customary international law as source of WTO law 53–7
customary international law central to interpreting WTO agreements 55
general principles of law 60
ICJ, and 47, 48
no clear specification of sources of WTO law 42
state consent 43
text of GATT/WTO as primary source of WTO law 49, 51–3
see also applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
World Trade Organization (WTO)
applicable law see applicable law before WTO disputes settlement body
challenges facing world trading system 8–15
consultative board examining see Sutherland Report
Haberler Report 9
Leutwiler Report 9
Charter and Annexes, WTO 29
Agreement on Agriculture (AG) 29
Civil Aircraft, Agreement on Trade in 30
DSU 29–30
GATS 29
Government Procurement, Agreement on 30
trade in goods agreements/GATT 29
Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TPRM) 30
TRIPS 29
China see China
common intentions of members 18
consensus and single undertaking principles 10
‘constructive ambiguity’ in trade negotiations 10
criticisms of 69
dispute settlement mechanism see Dispute Settlement Understanding/System (DSU)
emerging economies, and 15
equal treatment 51
establishment of 17, 18, 27
globalisation, and 7
good faith principle, WTO treaty obligations and 37, 49
Headquarters Agreement, WTO 28
implementation regime, theorising 63–88
nature of treaties and reputation costs 87–8
reputation costs as essential tool to enhance compliance with trade rules 81–7

Yenkong Ngangjoh Hodu and Zhang Qi - 9781783473854
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 04/18/2019 01:14:39AM
via free access
trade liberalisation as limitation of power of nation-state 63–72
world trade law compliance
discourse and constructivism 72–81
law see world trade law
legalism, trend towards 91–2
Marrakesh Agreement establishing 18, 28
members/member-based organisation 1, 2, 15, 28–9, 41
nature of immunity for WTO/staff from municipal courts’ jurisdiction 28
legal personality 28
multilateral institution, as 1, 2, 15, 27–9
rule-based trading system, as 2, 3
WTO Agreement as an ‘interpendence’ regime 54
reputation costs, and 82–7
reservations not permitted 38
trade liberalisation/economic growth, WTO as engine for 7, 36, 37
trade-related agreements, based on 15
unilateral actions 68–9