Index

afforestation 22
Agenda 21 43
agriculture 27, 77–8, 112, 211
amicus curiae briefs 46
Appellate Body see Panel and Appellate Body decisions
Argentina – Hides Leather 71
Assigned Amount Units (AAUs) 21–2, 28
Australia 4, 11–12, 28–30, 70
Assigned Amount Units (AAUs) 21
border tax adjustments 185, 199, 208
emissions liability 186–8
product inputs and GHG emissions 188–9
what is a tax? 193–5
Carbon Farming Initiative (CFI) 77–8, 211
carbon units 16, 19
credit units 17
financial products 116
GATS 106
ownership of emission units 122, 131
GATT
‘like products’ 77–8
quantitative restrictions 71–2
no prohibition on emissions 18, 29, 194
steel industry 139–40, 158, 173–4, 206–7
actionable subsidies and STPP 159–71
adverse effects and 165–7, 212
like products 168–9
specificity 170–71
subsidies 134, 149–51, 173–4
additional assistance 139–40, 158–71, 206–7
free allocation of units 136–8, 143, 155–7
TBT Agreement 92–4, 203–4
Australia – Automotive Leather 151
Australia – Automotive Leather II 154
border tax adjustments 175–7, 199–200, 207–8, 212, 214
emissions trading and 184–5, 189–90
emissions liability 185–8
emissions trading liability a tax? 190–96
GATT exceptions 196–200
product inputs and GHG emissions 188–90
free unit assistance vs 177
taxation principles
destination vs origin 178–9
direct and indirect 178–9, 181–4
WTO rules 179–81
Brazil – Aircraft 146
Brundtland Report 41
Canada – Aircraft 146–7, 153–4
Canada – Autos 73, 100, 107, 153
Canada – Measures Affecting the Sale of Gold Coins 60–61, 64
Canada – Periodicals 71
Canada – Unprocessed Herring and Salmon 82
Canada/Japan – Tariff On Imports Of Spruce, Pine, Fir (SPF) Dimension Lumber 63
carbon leakage and competitiveness 135–6, 177
see also border tax adjustments; subsidies
Emissions trading and WTO law

Celtic Extraction Ltd, In Re 66
Certified Emission Reductions (CERs) 21–2, 106
Australia 106, 204
European Union 25, 93, 106, 204
New Zealand 27, 93
TBT Agreement 92–4, 204
Chicago Climate Exchange 15
China – Audiovisual 171–3
China – Electronic Payment Services 116–17
China – Publications and Audiovisual Products 62
classification see GHG tradable instruments as goods/products
Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) 21–2, 106
European Union 25, 106
climate change regime, international 18–23, 214–15
trade, recognition of 41–3
command and control model 13–14, 25
comparative advantage principle 5, 36–8, 57, 213
competitiveness and carbon leakage 135–6, 177
see also border tax adjustments; subsidies
crondvergence of trade and environmental objectives 1–2, 38–44
countervailing duties 157–8
credits, units and permits 16–18, 31
Crouch v Credit Foncier of England Ltd 117
developing countries 21–2, 34, 38–9, 104, 114, 212–13
digital products 69
dispute settlement system, WTO 32–3, 44–9, 57
compulsory jurisdiction 45
interpretation of WTO rules see separate entry
Panel and Appellate Body decisions see separate entry
trade sanctions 45
distributive justice for developing countries 38–9
Doha Amendment to Kyoto Protocol 20
EC – Asbestos 81, 91
EC – Bananas III 105, 107, 111, 126
EC – Commercial Vessels 160
EC – Hormones 47
EC – Sardines 91, 95
EC – Tariff Preferences 80–81
economic efficiency model 13
EEC – Imports of Beef 73
EEC – Oilseeds 161
electronic documents 68–9, 119
Emission Reduction Units (ERUs) 22, 106
Australia 106, 204
European Union 25, 93, 106, 204
New Zealand 27, 93
TBT Agreement 92–4, 204
emissions trading and GATS (General Agreement on Trade in Services) 98–100, 130–32, 204–6, 211, 213
exception provisions general 125–32, 209
prudential carve-out 124–5, 210, 212
financial services 113–14, 131, 206, 211–12
definition 116–20
emissions unit as financial product 121–5
financial assets 116–17, 119–20, 131
negotiable instrument 116–18
prudential carve-out 124–5, 210, 212
transferable securities 116–20, 131
Understanding 114–16, 131
most favoured nation provision 99, 104–7, 111, 130–31, 205, 211
like services 105, 107–9
relevance of GATS 130
emissions units and services definition 102–4
scope of GATS 100–102

Felicity Deane - 9781783474424
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 03/30/2019 05:30:44AM via free access
Index

specific commitments 99, 109–10, 121, 126, 131, 205
GATS Schedules of 110
market access rule 99, 105, 109–10, 112–13, 129, 131, 205–6, 211
national treatment rule 99, 105, 109–12, 205, 211
enforcement of WTO law see dispute settlement system
environmental and health exceptions (Art XX, GATT) 79–85, 97, 129–30, 196–200, 209–10
Eurig Estate, Re 192
European Union 3–4, 11–12, 23–7, 31, 70
allowances 16–17, 19, 26–7, 76, 122
Assigned Amount Units (AAUs) 21
border tax adjustments 185, 199, 208
emissions liability 185–8
product inputs and GHG emissions 188–9
what is a tax? 192–6
carbon energy tax 24
financial instruments 26, 116, 132
GATS 106, 123, 131
GATT 116, 132
quantitative restrictions 71
National Allocation Plans (NAPs) 25–6
permits 17–19, 24–5, 29–30, 194–6
free allocation of units 136–7, 143, 155–7
TBT Agreement 93, 204
externalities, theory of 12
financial assets 116–17, 119–20, 131
financial instruments
Australia 116
European Union 26, 116, 132
GATS 99, 113–14, 130–32, 206, 211–12
emission unit as financial product 121–5
financial services definition 116–20
general exceptions 125–32
Understanding 114–16, 131
subsidies 141
forests 22–3
European Union 25
GATS (General Agreement on Trade in Services) 49, 58, 62, 69, 79, 85, 89
emissions trading and see separate entry
subsidies 134
GATT 1947 (General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1947) 33–6, 40–41, 47, 56, 181
GATT (General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994) 35–6, 49, 58, 98
border tax adjustments 178–84, 190–91, 208
GHG tradable instruments as goods/products see separate entry
nullification or impairment 160–62
subsidies 134, 171–3
GHG tradable instruments as goods/products 58–9, 64, 96–7, 120, 145–6, 202, 213
documentary intangibles 66
emissions units
categorising as products 67–70
as personal property 64–6
Harmonized System (HS) 62–3, 67–8
implications within GATT 70, 97, 203, 211
criterion of ‘like products’ 72–9, 97
health and environmental exception 79–85, 97, 129–30, 196–200, 209
most favoured nation rule 72–4, 89–90, 97
national security exception 79, 85–9, 209
national treatment rule 74–5, 97
quantitative restrictions rule 71–2, 97, 113
relevant exceptions 79–89, 97, 196–9
Emissions trading and WTO law

ordinary meaning’ 59–60
WTO jurisprudence 60–62
goods 145–6, 213
GHG tradable instruments as goods/products see separate entry
SCM Agreement 143–6
government bonds 141

Harper v Minister for Sea Fisheries 193–5
health and environmental exceptions (Art XX, GATT) 79–85, 97, 129–30, 196–200, 209–10
health or life exception (Art XIV, GATS) 126–32, 209
history of WTO 33–6

India – Autos 75
Indonesia – Autos 168
international carbon market 30, 70
International Convention on the Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding System (HS Convention) 62–3, 67–8
International Court of Justice (ICJ) 62
International Organization for Standardization (ISO) 96
international standards
TBT Agreement 95–6
interpretation of WTO rules 57, 144
authoritative interpretations of WTO bodies 55–6
customary rules of international law 49–52
dispute settlement reports 52–4
evolutionary manner 50, 69
subsequent practice of WTO members 55
supplementary sources 56–7

Japan
Assigned Amount Units (AAUs) 21
Japan – Alcoholic Beverages II 55, 76
Joint Implementation (JI) projects 22, 27, 106
European Union 25, 106

Korea – Commercial Vessels 165
Korea – Imported Beef 81, 128
Kyoto Protocol 18, 76
Assigned Amount Units (AAUs) 21–2
Certified Emission Reductions (CERs) 21–2
Doha Amendment 20
Emission Reduction Units (ERUs) 22
nation-based trading market 19–20
purpose of 19
Removal Units (RMUs) 22–3
supplementarity principle 25
trade, recognition of 42–3

Liechtenstein 21
like products 75–9, 167
border adjustments 178–80
most favoured nation rule 72–4, 94, 97, 107
national treatment rule 75, 94, 97
SCM Agreement 165, 167–9
like services
market access provision 105, 113
most favoured nation provision 105, 107–9, 205
national treatment provision 105
loan guarantees 141
long-term CERs (ICERs) 22
New Zealand 27
market access rule (GATS) 99, 105, 109–10, 112–13, 129, 131, 205–6, 211
market, international carbon 30, 70
market mechanism theories 12–13
markets, emissions trading 14–16
mechanics of emissions trading 11
international law 18–19
markets 14–16
units, credits and permits 16–18
Mexico – Telecoms 123
Monaco 21
Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer 43
most favoured nation (MFN)
Index

GATS 99, 104–7, 111, 130–31, 205, 211
like services 105, 107–9
GATT 72–4, 89–90, 97
TBT Agreement 94

like services 107–8
gated services 107–9
GATT 72–4, 89–90, 97
TBT Agreement 94

nation state members of WTO 15
national security exception
GATS (Art XIV bis) 130, 209
GATT (Art XXI) 79, 85–9, 209
national treatment (NT) rule 214
GATS 99, 105, 109–12, 205, 211
GATT 74–5, 97
TBT Agreement 94

national treatment rule 75
most favoured nation rule 73, 105–7
preferential trade agreements 90
product/goods 60–62, 144–5
quantitative restrictions 71
questions of fact and of law 47
SCM Agreement 120
subsidies 140, 157, 213–14
additional assistance 159–61, 165–71
conferral of benefit 146–51
foregone revenue 142–3
goods 144–5
prohibited 153–4, 156
sustainable development 40–41, 57
technical regulations 91–2, 95–6
permits, units and credits 16–18, 31
Pigouvian taxes 12–13
polluter pays principle 12, 57, 214
precedent/stare decisis 52–5
preferential trade agreements 89–90
private property model 13
process and production methods (PPMs) 92–3, 96
products/goods 145–6, 213
GHG tradable instruments as goods/products see separate entry
SCM Agreement 143–6
protectionism 38, 43, 129, 156, 166, 198, 215

recommendations
emissions trading schemes 210–12
WTO law 212–14
reforestation 22
regional and preferential trade agreements 89–90
regulated and voluntary markets 15
Removal Units (RMUs) 22–3
res communis 18
Rio Earth Summit (1992) 43
sanctions, trade 45, 88
SCM (Subsidies and Countervailing Measures) Agreement 49, 61, 120, 134–5, 139, 207, 213–14

Panel and Appellate Body decisions 45–8, 57, 69, 210
border tax adjustments 176, 180, 191–2, 195, 198
GATS 99–100, 105–8
exceptions 126–30
financial assets 116–17
market access 123
security 118
health and environmental exceptions 80–84
interpretation of WTO rules see separate entry
like products 76, 78

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development) 121
ozone layer 43

removal units 22–3
res communis 18
Rio Earth Summit (1992) 43
additional assistance 139–40, 158–71, 212
border adjustments 179–84, 190–91, 199, 208
definition of subsidies 140–52
extinction provisions 171–3, 179
prohibited subsidies 152–7
remedies for 157–8
Shrimp – Turtle 84
sources of international law 51–2
standards, international
TBT Agreement 95–6
stare decisis 52–5
subsidies 133–5, 173–4, 213–14
additional assistance 139–40, 158, 206–7
actionable subsidies and STPP 159–71
injury to domestic industry 162–3
like products 165, 167–9
nullification or impairment 160–62
serious prejudice 164–5
specificity 169–71
steel industry and adverse effects 165–7, 212
adoption of emissions trading schemes 149, 173
assistance
additional 139–40, 158–71
free allocation of units 136–8, 143, 155–7
competitiveness and carbon leakage 135–6
definition of 140–41, 152
conferral of a benefit 146–51
financial contribution 141–6
foregone revenue 141–3, 146
like products 143–6
exception provisions 171–3
prohibited 212
export 152–7
import substitution 155
remedies 157–8
sulphur dioxide 19
supplementarity principle of Kyoto Protocol 25
sustainable development 38, 57, 214
definition 41
international standards 96
WTO objectives 39–41
Switzerland 21
taxation 176
designation 175
direct and indirect taxation 178–9, 181–4
origin vs 178–9
WTO rules 179–81
emissions trading and border tax adjustments 184–5, 189–90, 199–200, 207–8, 212, 214
emissions liability 185–8
emissions trading liability a tax? 190–96
GATT exceptions 196–200
product inputs and GHG emissions 188–90
EU: carbon energy tax 24
national treatment rule 74–5
Pigouvian taxes 12–13
subsidies 150, 174
foregone revenue 142–3, 146
TBT (Technical Barriers to Trade) Agreement 49, 97, 203–4
emissions trading and technical standards 90–93
international standards 95–6
substantive provisions 93–4
temporary CERs (tCERs) 22
New Zealand 27
Thailand – Cigarettes 81
theories associated with emissions trading 12–14
trade sanctions 45, 88
tragedy of the commons 13
transferable securities 116–20, 131
Tuna – Dolphin 78
Turkey – Textiles 90
United Kingdom 66, 117
United Nations
Charter 87
Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) 20
trade, recognition of 41–3
Index

voluntary restraint 18
Security Council 87–8, 209
United States 3, 33–4, 176
sulphur dioxide 19
units, credits and permits 16–18, 31
Uruguay Round 34–6, 56, 98
US – Clove Cigarettes 94
US – Cotton 170
US – Exports Restraints 169
US – FSC 142–3, 150
US – Gambling 126–9
US – Gasoline 75, 83, 129, 198
US – Imports of Sugar from Nicaragua 86
US – Large Civil Aircraft (2nd complaint) 166–7
US – Lead and Bismuth II 147, 150
US – Offset Act (Byrd Amendment) 159–61
US – Shrimp 40–41, 82–3, 129, 198
US – Softwood Lumber III 61, 140, 144–5, 147–8, 195
US – Softwood Lumber IV 61, 145, 148–9, 170
US – Tobacco 191–2
US – Tuna II (Mexico) 95–6
US – Wool Shirts and Blouses 151
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 50–51, 55–7, 144
voluntary markets 15
World Trade Organization (WTO) 4–7, 32–3, 48–9, 57, 201–2
border tax adjustments see separate entry
dispute settlement system see separate entry
GATS see separate entry
GATT see separate entry
history 33–6
interpretation rules 57, 144
authoritative interpretations of WTO bodies 55–6
customary rules of international law 49–52
dispute settlement reports 52–4
subsequent practice of WTO members 55
supplementary sources 56–7
relevance of WTO law for emissions trading 44
convergence of trade and environmental objectives 38–44
enforcement of WTO laws 44–8
theories supporting WTO law objectives 36–8
structure of 35