Index

A (FC) and Others (FC) v Secretary of State for the Home Department, UK (2005) 59
A, B and C judgment, Iceland (2010) 35
Aall, Jørgen 111
accords internationaux (international agreements) 43
acts of consent see consent, acts of
Adalsteinsson, Ragnar 96, 124, 125
Ægisson judgment, Iceland (1990) 41, 121–7, 134
Alabama principle 3
Alfredsson, Gudmundur 1, 2, 67
Althing (national parliament of Iceland) 52, 122
Alvarez, José 2
Andenæs, John 37, 50
application of incorporated treaties 133–69
Denmark 141–2
direct 165
France 136–8
Germany 134–6
Iceland 143–69
main findings
application of consistent interpretation principle in relation to statutory interpretation 165–6
application of ECHR together with constitution 166–9
application of principles of consistent interpretation in relation to constitution 166
cases concerning right to compensation and other reparations for victims of breach of Convention rights 169
direct application 165
Norway 142–3
United Kingdom 138–41
ASJ judgment, Iceland (2002) 66, 147, 152, 166
Aust, Anthony 16, 48, 140
Austin, John 33
automatic incorporation doctrine 7, 8, 55–60, 84, 89
and consistent interpretation principle 105
B v A judgment, Iceland (2010) 103
Bartolus of Sassoferrato (1314–57), medieval jurist 19
basic norm 24
Beemelmanns, Hubert 46, 47
Benediktsson, Bjarni 122
Bergbohm, Karl 26
Bernhardt, Rudolf 69, 95
Birgisson judgment (1995) 102, 161
Björgvinsson, David 71
Blackburn, Robert 92, 139, 140
Blackstone, William 20, 58
Bleckmann, Albert 35
Bosnia and Herzegovina, constitution 67
Bragadóttir case (1996) 10
Bragason, Hrafn 121
Brownlie, Ian 4, 29
Brussels Convention on Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters (1968) 72

181
"Charming Betsy" doctrine
consistent interpretation principle 104
CJEU see Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)
compensation, right to for breach of Convention rights 163–5, 169
see also remedies and reparations
A Concise History of the Law of Nations (Nussbaum) 21
consent, acts of
Germany 46
Nordic countries 49, 52
consistent interpretation principle 3, 8, 93, 98, 104–20
application by ECHR for consistent interpretation of Icelandic Constitution 151–5
application in relation to constitution 166
application in relation to statutory interpretation 165–6
application in relation to unincorporated treaties 120
consent
case law 113–19
"Charming Betsy" doctrine 104
and direct effect 105
and dualism 105, 109, 111, 112
grounds for application 105–6
incorporated and unincorporated international law 105, 120
and legal policy 104–5
legislative intent 107
main findings 119–20
theoretical and practical effects of consistent interpretation 109–10
and transformation doctrine 105, 109, 111, 112
constitutions
application of principles of consistent interpretation in relation to 166
constitutionality of legislative act vs whether given act compatible with constitution 137
ECHR applied together with 150–51, 155–63, 166–9
Iceland see constitution, Iceland
constitution, Iceland 85, 95
see also Iceland
consistent interpretation of, application by ECHR 151–5
Constitutional Act No. 97/1995 64, 66, 67, 68, 106, 115, 151, 155
constitutional changes in 1995 64–8
ECHR applied together with 150–51
to assert the existence of fundamental principles of law 156–7
cases 155–63
compensation, right to for breach of Convention rights 163–5
to establish a breach of fundamental rights 157–8
where constitutionality and conventionality of decisions and legislation are examined 159–60
where constitutionality and conventionality of legislative acts are examined 160–62
where content and substance of statutory law derived from the constitution and ECHR 158–9
treaty-making process 51
constitutional and political theories 38–9
criticism of dualism as a constitutional and political theory 37–8
criticism of monist 30–31
earlier constitutional and political monist theories 26–8
modern monist 28–30
monism as a constitutional and political theory 26–31
value of earlier theories 27
Convention on Psychotropic Substances (1971) 77–8
Index

Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) 65, 72–3, 100
Costa, Jean Paul 146
Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)
relevance of case law 71
customary international law 5, 58, 59–60
see also international law
customary law, international
Sweden 59–60

Dark Ages 19
de facto erga omnes effect 146
Denmark
analysis and interpretation of judgments 11
application of incorporated treaties 141–2
constitution 48, 62
as dualist country 53, 84, 93–4
Explanatory Reports 148
instruction, rule of 100, 110
interpretation, rule of 107
legal guarantees rule 98
presumption, rule of 98, 107
transformation doctrine 49, 60, 62–3
treaty-making process 48–50, 53, 74

Derbyshire County Council v Times Newspaper, UK (1993) 139
Detter, Ingrid 6, 7, 8, 36, 146
Dickson, Susan J. 47
Die Moderne Staatidee (Krabbe) 21
direct effect 75, 87, 89–103
concept 89–90
and consistent interpretation principle 105

dualist countries 91–103
Germany and France 90–91

Dixon, Martin 7
domestic law see national law
dualism 15–16, 102

see also dualist countries; monism;
theories, domestic and international law;
transformation doctrine

Ægisson case 122, 126

and consistent interpretation principle 105, 109, 111, 112
as a constitutional and political theory 34–7

criticism of, as constitutional and political theory 37–8
historical and philosophical foundations 31–4, 38
limitations of approach 3
in practice 41–2
traditional monism–dualism dichotomy 13, 38
dualist countries 53, 84, 91–103
Denmark 53, 84, 93–4
Iceland 53, 84, 86, 95, 95–103
Norway 53, 84, 94–5
United Kingdom 53, 92, 140

Duguit, Léon 20, 21, 22
Dupré, Chatarine 137

Eiríksson judgment, Iceland (1975) 95
Eisemann, Pierre Michael 44, 91, 136, 137

Ellertsson judgment, Iceland (1994) 130

EP v Municipality of Avellino, Italy (2008) 59
European Commission of Human Rights 122, 123
European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 3, 41, 65, 68–9
applied together with constitution 166–9
to assert the existence of fundamental principles of law 156–7
cases 155–63
compensation, right to for breach of Convention rights 163–5
to establish a breach of fundamental rights 157–8
Iceland 150–51, 155–63
where constitutionality and conventionality of decisions and legislation are examined 159–60
where constitutionality and conventionality of legislative acts are examined 160–62
where content and substance of statutory law derived from the constitution and ECHR 158–9

Articles

Article 2 (right to life) 6
Article 5 (right to liberty) 157
Article 6 (right to fair trial) 152
Article 7 (safeguards against arbitrary prosecution) 138
Article 8 (privacy) 160
Article 10 (freedom of expression) 139, 160
Article 11 (freedom of assembly and association) 154
Article 13 (effective remedy) 129, 130
Article 46 (abiding by final judgment of the court) 129

Case law of domestic courts relating to (Iceland) 148–65
application for consistent interpretation of the constitution 151–5
application together with constitution 150–51, 155–63
direct application as statutory law 149

compensation, right to for breach of rights 163–5, 169
and Denmark 98
and France 137
and Germany 90–91
Grand Chamber judgments involving the UK 148
and Iceland 65, 68–9, 133, 150–51, 155–63
incorporation 92
remedies and reparations 129
and treaty-making process 50

European Convention on Recognition and Enforcement of Decisions concerning Custody of Children and on Restoration of Custody of Children (1980) 76

European Court of Human Rights (ECHR)
Ægisson case 122
status of decisions and judgments 144–8
and treaty-making process 50

European Economic Area (EEA)
Agreement see European Economic Area (EEA) Agreement
and domestic law 4, 5
primacy of law 70

European Economic Area (EEA)
Agreement 4
Advisory Opinions 71–2
duty to implement 70
and Iceland 69–72
and Lugano Convention 72
and Norway 111
primacy of EEA law 70
relevance of case law of CJEU 71

European Parliament (EP) 61

European Union (EU)
and domestic law 4
Explanatory Reports 10, 141, 142, 143, 148
Denmark 148
Iceland 64–5, 67, 69, 105, 144, 145, 146

Feldman, David 34, 35, 105
Fililet, Arne 50
Finnbogason judgment, Iceland (2000) 164
Fischer, Peter 32
Fitzmaurice, Gerald 16–17, 30, 34
Flanders, C. 107

France
application of incorporated treaties 136–8
automatic incorporation doctrine 56, 59
Conseil Constitutionelle 137
Conseil d‘Etat 91
constitution 43, 44–5, 56
Cour de Cassation 91
direct effect 91
ECHR, ratification 137

David T. Björgvinsson - 9781785361876
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/13/2019 01:04:04PM
via free access
Index

Maastricht Treaty 1992, ratification 44–5
as monist state 53
treaty-making process 43–5, 53, 54
Frowein, Jochen Abr 45, 46, 47
full incorporation 9
by adaption 85–6
Iceland 68–74
Garlicki, Lech 2, 149
Geirsson judgment, Iceland (1997) 163
Germany
acts of consent 46
application of incorporated treaties 134–6
and automatic incorporation doctrine 58
Basic Law 45, 46, 58, 90
constitution 90
Constitutional Court 134, 136
direct effect 90–1
and European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 90–91
Federal Constitutional Court 47
Federal Republic 47
as monist state 53
transformation doctrine 60
treaty-making process 45–7, 53
Germer, Peter 11, 142
globalisation 36
Goldsworthy, Jeffrey 127
Good Morning America judgments (1999) 159, 167
Görgülül v Germany (2004) 135
Greig, D.W. 12
Gudmundsdóttir v University of Iceland (1999) 114
Gulmann, Claus 48, 93, 107
Gunnarsson judgment, Iceland (1992) 96, 102
Gunnlaugsson, Jón Steinar 35

Hahn, Micheal J. 45, 46, 47
Hallgrimsson judgment, Iceland (2006) 102

Haraldsson and Sveinsson v Iceland (2007) 117
Hart, H.L.H. 33
Hauschildt v Denmark (1989) 147
Helgesen, Jan E. 50
Henkin, Louis 34
Holmes, Oliver Wendell 127
H.P. Bulmer Ltd v J. Bollinger SA UK (1974) 68
human rights

see also European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR); European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR)
breach of fundamental rights 157–8
Human Rights Act (1998), UK 138, 139, 140
Human Rights Act (1999), Norway 94, 98
international protection 29

Iceland

see also specific cases
Althing (national parliament) 52, 122
analysis and interpretation of judgments 10
application of incorporated treaties 143–69
ECHR, case law of domestic courts relating to 148–65
ECtHR, status of decisions and judgments 144–8
Code on Civil Procedure 124, 125
constitution see constitution, Iceland as dualist country 53, 84, 86, 95, 95–103
ECHR, case law of domestic courts relating to assertion of existence of fundamental principles of law 156–7
cases where ECHR applied for consistent interpretation of the constitution 151–5
cases where ECHR applied together with the constitution 155–63
The intersection of international law and domestic law

compensation, right to for breach of Convention rights 163–5
constitutionality and conventionality of decisions and legislation examined 159–60
constitutionality and conventionality of legislative acts examined 160–62
content and substance of statutory law derived from the constitution and ECHR 158–9
direct application of ECHR as statutory law 149
ECHR applied together with constitution 150–51
establish of a breach of fundamental rights 157–8
and European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 65, 133, 150–51, 155–63
and full incorporation 68–9
European Economic Area (EEA) Agreement 69–72
Advisory Opinions 71–2
duty to implement 70
Lugano Convention 72
primacy of EEA law 70
relevance of case law of CJEU 71
Explanatory Reports 64–5, 67, 69, 105, 144, 145, 146
full incorporation 68–74
Convention on the Rights of the Child 65, 72–3
European Convention on Human Rights 68–9
European Economic Area (EEA) Agreement 69–72
Icelandic Act No 14/1979 73–4
legality principle 82
partial incorporation 74–83
adaptation of a treaty to national law 76–9
referential incorporation 79–83
Penal Code 78, 83, 114
statutes

Act on Fishing in Iceland’s Fisheries Jurisdiction (1997) 118
Act on Foreigners (2002) 105
Act on Icelandic Nationality (1952) 105
Act on Information (1996) 83
Act on the Accession of Iceland to the Convention on Future Multilateral Cooperation in North-East Atlantic Fisheries (1981) 81
Act on the Applicable Law to Contractual Obligations (2000) 81
Act on the Scientific Preservation of the Fishing Stocks within the Economic Zone (1948) 75, 81, 118
Constitutional Act No. 97/1995 64, 66, 67, 68, 106, 115, 151, 155
Fisheries Management Act (1990) 118
Narcotics Act (1974) 77, 81
Supreme Court 10, 67, 95, 117
see also Ægisson judgment, Iceland (1990)
transformation doctrine 60, 64–83, 95
treaty-making process 51–2, 53, 64
value of research on 41–2
incorporation 5, 6–10
The intersection of international law and domestic law

Kelsen, Hans 20, 23–6
Kessedjian, Chaterine 44, 91
Kök, Herbert Franz 32
Krabbe, Hugo 20, 21–2
Kristinsson judgment, Iceland (1985) 122
see also Jón Kristinsson v Iceland (1990)
Kristjánsson and others, case of (Iceland, 2000) 116–17
Langborger v Sweden (1989) 147
Lauterpacht, Hersch 20, 21, 26, 29
law
customary 5, 58, 59–60
EEA, primacy of 70
international see international and national law, relationship between; international law; theories, domestic and international law
national see national law; theories, domestic and international law
natural law theories 26
pure theory of (Kelsen) 23
and state 5, 22
treaty 5
Law and Ministerial Gazette (Section C) 73, 78, 79, 85, 117
legal guarantees rule, Denmark 98
legal norms, hierarchical nature 24, 107
see also international norms, status; norms, theory of (Kelsen)
legal positivism 33
legality principle, Iceland 82
Lenoir, Noëlle 2
lex posterior principle 52
lex superior 134
logical positivism 23, 25
Luchaire, François 44, 91, 137
Luedicke, Belkacem and Koç v Germany (1978) 98
Lugano Convention on Jurisdiction and the Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters (1988) 72
MVK judgment, Iceland (2000) 161–2
Maastricht Treaty 1992
ratification by France 44–5
Magnisson judgment, Iceland (1992) 113, 119
medieval universalism 19
Mégret, Fredéric 38
Middle Ages 19
Mitchell, Andrew D. 6, 61
Möller, Jakob 1, 2
monism 15–16, 20–31
see also dualism; theories, domestic and international law
and birth of modern theories 21–2
concept 2–3, 20
and consistent interpretation principle 105
as a constitutional and political theory 26–31
criticism of monist constitutional and political theories 30–31
earlier constitutional and political monist theories 26–8
modern monist constitutional and political theories 28–30
monist states 53
as a philosophical theory 21–6, 38
positivist-monist theories 23–6
in practice 41–2
sector 61
socio-psychological monist theories 20–21
traditional monism–dualism dichotomy 13, 38
monistic view 24
Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer (1985) 101
Morgenstern, Felice 107, 150
Moser, Johann Jakob 26, 27
municipal law 5, 32
see also national law
Murray v The Charming Betsy, USA (1804) 104
narcotic drugs 77–8
national law
Index

see also international and national law, relationship between; municipal law and EU/EEA law 4–5
primacy of national law principle 3
supremacy 26
terminology 5
and ‘Umgass’ (recasting/transformation) 32
natural law theories 26
Netherlands
automatic incorporation doctrine 56
Code on Criminal Procedure 98
Supreme Court 97
no-direct applicability principle 3
Nollkaemper, André 2, 4, 5, 7, 12, 15, 56, 57, 59, 60, 75, 89, 97, 105, 106, 107, 109, 112, 128, 129, 150
Nordic countries
see also Denmark; Iceland; Norway; Sweden
transformation doctrine 49, 62–83
treaty-making process 48–52, 53, 64, 74
normative treaties 46
norms, theory of (Kelsen) 23, 24, 25
see also international norms, status
Norway
application of incorporated treaties 142–3
Code on Criminal Procedure 63
constitution 50
as dualist country 53, 84, 94–5
and EEA 70, 111
Klinge case (Norsk Retstidende), 1946 94, 111
Penal Code 63
presumption, rule of 111
statutory law 63
transformation doctrine 60, 63
treaty-making process 50, 51, 53
Nussbaum, Arthur 19, 21, 22, 26, 28
O’Brien, John 16
oil pollution, applicable conventions 73
Öskarsson judgment, Iceland (1996) 160
Opuz v Turkey (2009) 146
Ostensen judgment, Iceland (1998) 160, 167
pacta sunt servanda principle 3
partial incorporation (quasi-incorporation) by adaption 85–6
Iceland 74–83
impact of international instruments on content of statutory legislation/constitution 10
reference to in text of statutory legislation 9–10
Partsch, Karl Josef 8, 36
Paulus, Andreas L. 45, 134, 135
Petersen, Niels 13
Ponsonby Rule, UK 48
pornography 160
positivist-monist theories 23–6
Post and Telecom Administration (PTA), Iceland 79, 80
presumption, rule of 98, 107, 111
primacy of international treaties over national law principle 107
primacy of national law principle 3
Principles of General Theory of Law and State (Kelsen) 24
psychological double-bind 4
psychotropic substances 78
pure theory of law (Kelsen) 23
R v Miah, UK (1973) 138
R v Secretary of the Home Department ex parte Brind, UK (1991) 119, 139
Ragnarsson judgment, Iceland (1997) 149
ratification of treaties see under treaty-making process
referential incorporation 79–83
remedies and reparations 128–32
Ress, Georg 148
Richter, Dagmar 136
Rothwell, Donald R. 10, 76
Rousseau, Charles 16

David T. Björgvinsson - 9781785361876
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/13/2019 01:04:04PM via free access
Ruud, Morten 51
Schelle, Georges 20
Schram, Gunnar G. 73, 75
secondary legislation 23
Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs, UK 47
sector monism 61
Seidl Hohenveldern, Ignaz 59
Sejersted, Fredirick 63
self-determination, national 34
separation of powers principle 35, 37
Shaw, Malcolm N. 25, 58, 59, 92
Shelton v Þorláksson judgment, Iceland (2005) 103
Sigfússon judgment, Iceland (1995) 126, 152, 166, 167
Sinclair, Ian 47
Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs (1961) 77
Skoghøy, Jens Edvin A. 99
Skúladóttir judgment, Iceland (1996) 149, 165
Sloss, David 4, 6, 9, 76, 128
’small states argument’ 38
Smith, Carsten 35–7, 94, 95
socio-psychological monist theories 20–21
sovereignty (state omnipotence) 28, 29, 34
Spielmann, Dean 58
Spiermann, Dean 91, 134, 148
Spiermann, Ole 11, 35, 93, 107, 116
stare decisis principle 58
state
and law 5, 22
omnipotence of 28
and status of international law 29
State Prosecutor v X judgment, Iceland (1997) 156, 157–8, 167
Stefánsdóttir judgment, Iceland (1999) 162
Stefánsson, Stefán Már 96
supremacy
of international law 29
of national law 26
Supreme Court of Iceland 10, 67, 95, 117
see also Ægisson judgment, Iceland (1990)
Sverrisson judgment, Iceland (1986) 122
Sweden
and automatic incorporation doctrine 59–60
Switzerland
automatic incorporation doctrine 56
terminology 5–6
incorporation 6–7
terrorism 105
theories, domestic and international law 15–16, 19–39
dualism see dualism
modern theories, birth 21–2
monism see monism
traditional monism–dualism
dichotomy 13, 38
Tómasson, Eiríkur 97
Traité de droit constitutionnel (Duguit) 22
transformation doctrine 55–6, 60–83, 102
see also dualism
Ægisson case 126
and consistent interpretation
principle 105, 109, 111, 112
Nordic countries 49, 62–83, 95
terminology/concept 5, 8
United Kingdom 60, 61
traité préparatoires 153
treaty-making process
France 43–5
Germany 45–7
growth in number of international
 treaties 1
national differences 52–3
Nordic countries 48–52, 53, 64, 74
normative treaties 46
and ratification 3, 41, 43–54
travé et ratification 3, 41, 43–54
treaty law 5
United Kingdom 47–8
Treviranus, Hans D. 46, 47
Triepel, Heinrich 31, 32, 33
Troper, Michel 25, 30
Index

Ulfstein, Geir 51
UN Human Rights Committee for International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 7
United Kingdom
application of incorporated treaties 138–41
and automatic incorporation doctrine 58
as dualist country 53, 92, 140
Human Rights Act (1998) 138, 139, 140
Ponsonby Rule 48
Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs 47
stare decisis principle 58
transformation doctrine 60, 61
treaty-making process 47–8, 53, 54
Universal Declaration of Human Rights 147
universalism 19
Verzijl, J.H.W. 32
Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer (1985) 101
Vigfússon judgment (2002), Iceland 79
Völkerrecht und Landesrecht (Triepel) 31
von Hannover v Germany (2004) 135
Vörukaup judgement, Iceland (1999) 100–101
Walker, Kristen 6, 61
Wasilkowski, Andrzej 19, 32
Waters, Melissa A. 112
Wathne judgment, Iceland (1995) 158, 167
Wenzel, Max 27
Wildhaber, Luzius 16, 32
X v Iceland (1976) 96
Yeh, Jiunn-Rong 30–31, 36, 67
Zimmerman, Andreas 135
Zorn, Albert 26–7