Index

Abi-Saab, G. 57
ACHR see American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR)
acquired or vested rights, theory of 209–12
acte contraire doctrine 108–9, 113
Ago, R. 162
Alma Ata Declaration (1992) 218
amendment procedures, simplified 116–21, 124, 125, 142
American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR) 59–60
optional clause concerning jurisdiction of I-ACtHR 174, 181
and reservations to human rights treaties 241–2
withdrawal cases 155, 178, 182, 184, 185
automatic succession doctrine 5, 190, 193
‘accidental’ emergence of 203–6
automaticity rule, denial 213–14
case law, inconclusiveness 221–30
general case law 228–30
Yugoslavian cases before ICJ 221–7
consensualist paradigm 232–3
emergence of 206–30
ipso jure succession 204, 205, 215, 216
justifications for, with regard to human rights treaties 207–12
nature of human rights treaties 208–9
vested or acquired rights, theory of 209–12
legal issues 213–20
degree of automaticity 213–20
lessons from conundrum 230–33
notification 217–18, 230
retroactive effect of notification 217–18
practical unsustainability of 230–31
see also clean slate doctrine; public order treaties, succession to autonomy 2, 14, 16, 19, 27, 89
and community 14, 15, 32
of consent 93, 140
in expression of consent to be bound 147, 148
sovereign 100, 141
State 3, 17, 19
of will 24, 42, 64, 100, 106, 113, 141, 190, 191
Azerbaijan 219
Balkin, J.M. 13, 24
Bederman, D. 45
Belilos case 279, 298, 303, 306
Bergbohm, C. 39–40
bilateral treaties 46, 48, 50, 53, 64, 72
bilaterialization of treaty regimes objections to 263–70
reciprocity and bilateralization problem 264–5
and reservations to human rights treaties 236
binary and transformational analysis 16–30
argumentative strategy 15, 38
binary and transformational character of tension between self and community 15–16
The paradigm of State consent in the law of treaties

consensualist paradigm 18, 19
constant oscillation and transformation of theoretical constructions 30
content, problem of 27–30
egotism and cooperation/community 16, 17–21
esoteric and constructed intent, fluctuation between 22–7
individualism versus communitarianism, fluctuation between 15–19, 22
in law of treaties 16–30
linear analysis, limitations 15–16
mutual exclusiveness, impossibility of 15
oscillation 19, 22, 24, 25
pacta sunt servanda principle 19–21
poles, establishment of 15, 16, 18
process and content, tension between 30
rule/exception approach 37
State will and subjectivism 23–4
treaty as negotium, versus treaty as instrumentum 27–30
binding nature of treaties 18, 19, 24
intention of parties 75–6
treaty form 22–7, 75
Bosnia-Herzegovina 213, 217, 221, 222–3, 225, 228
Bourdieu, P. 38
Bowett, D. 255, 302
Brierty, J.L. 91
CAHDI see Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law (Council of Europe)
Cartagena Protocol 144
Chinkin, C. 26
Churchill, R. 147
classification debate
classification of treaty obligations 48–53
and construction of treaty identities 41–2, 47, 57–8, 64–7
contemporary classifications of treaties 58–67
common/collective interest 62–3
emergence of 34–7
historical attempts at classification 39–67
classification in the ILC codification project 47–58
Rechtsgeschäfte versus Rechtsätze 39–40
traités-contrats versus traités-lois 42–7
Vereinbarungen versus Verträge 40–42
merits and pitfalls of classification efforts 37–9
utility of classification 37, 38
necessity for classification 37
new types of treaties 82
over- and under-inclusiveness of treaty classifications 62
rule/exception approach 37
Vienna regime 42, 55, 63, 65
clean slate doctrine 193, 196–203
‘accidental’ emergence of the automatic succession principle and exceptions to 203–6
continuity upon notification, right to 196–9
and sovereignty 190, 191
subject matter exception to 199–203
see also automatic succession principle; public order treaties, succession to
collective/common interest 1, 3, 8, 39, 103, 125, 232, 304, 310, 325, 326, 327, 328, 329
classification debate 62, 63
‘collective interest’ treaties 58, 62, 66–7, 81, 82, 324
egotism and cooperation/community 17, 18, 19
expression of consent to be bound 140, 141, 142, 147
reciprocity 83, 87
reservations, human rights treaties 234, 236, 237, 239
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index</th>
<th>359</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>and right to denounce a treaty 167–74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and soft law 79, 80, 81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>withdrawal from a treaty 186, 324</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee against Torture (CAT) 217, 220</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law (Council of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe) 319</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>common interest 62–3, 71</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>see also collective interest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>communitarian considerations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ambivalence of notion of common interest 324</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>classification debate 35, 50, 57, 62, 66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community values 324, 325</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>identity of treaties 70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>individualism versuscommunitarianism, fluctuation between 15–19, 22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and reciprocity 84</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and soft law 79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conferences/Meetings of the Parties (COP/MOP) 115, 134, 143–6,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150–51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>delegation of rule-making authority to 115, 133, 134</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and expression of consent to be bound 133 et seq.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>theory of remote/general consent 131, 133, 134</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo v. Rwanda case 228, 259, 260, 282, 287, 291–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consensualist paradigm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>amendment procedures 116–21, 124, 125, 142</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>automatic succession doctrine 232–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>binary and transformational analysis 18, 19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flexibilization of 5, 6, 152</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and legal security 102</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>outer limits of informality in 116–47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as plea for the construction of a participatory treaty model 281</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tension between self and community 15–16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>see also Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT) continuity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>upon notification, right to 196–9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>contract law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and binary/transformational analysis 15–16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>concept of contract 67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>contrats d’adhésion 67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and domestic law analogies 17, 43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>freedom of contract 66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and reciprocity 42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>see also contractual treaties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>contractual treaties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>classification debate 35–7, 39, 42–4, 46–7, 52, 54, 64–5, 67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>see also law-making treaties; treaties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on Facilitation of International Maritime Traffic 121</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on International Civil Aviation 119</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fauna and Flora (CITES) 143</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) 175, 267, 272–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD) 272, 273</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on the Rights of the Child 217</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>critical approach to international treaty law 8–9, 13–16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>binary and transformational character of tension between self and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community 15–16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conceptual dualities 13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self and the community, fundamental tension between 14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia 213, 221, 225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>customary international law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disadvantages of, compared to treaties 71</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shift to multilateral treaties from 71–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vassilis Pergantis - 9781786432230
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/03/2019 08:48:19AM
via free access
deformalization 141–7, 328
Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) 259, 260
denunciation of treaties see withdrawal of treaties
dialogue dénonciateur 8, 187
dialogue framework, reservations 314–21
contribution of treaty actors in the dialogue réservatoire 316–21
depository, role 316–17
dialogue réservatoire 8
preconditions for development of a dialogue réservatoire 315–16
State parties, role 318–21
treaty bodies, role 317–18
dialogue successoral 8, 232, 233
dispute settlement clauses
exclusive versus complementary nature of 291–2
as fundamental object/essence of human rights treaties 180–86, 292–4
optional clauses and protocols 286–94
optional versus compulsory nature of 288–91
do ut des paradigm 57
domestic law analogies 17, 43
dPRK see North Korea, withdrawal from NPT
Dupuy, R.-J. 79
ECmHR see European Commission of Human Rights (ECmHR)
Economic and Social Council Official Records (ESCOR) 268
egotistical interests of States 3, 17–18, 35, 50, 57, 83
egotism and cooperation/community 16, 17–21, 83
enabling clauses 133–4, 146, 175
environmental law, international 114, 115, 152
erga omnes status 46, 208, 297
erga omnes contractantes 60, 265, 277
Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission, Partial Award on Ethiopia’s Claim 4 concerning Prisoners of War 229
esoteric and constructed intent, fluctuation between 22–7
discursive juxtaposition 22–3
form, recourse to 23
European Commission of Human Rights (ECmHR) 58–9, 62, 66
European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 63, 66, 187, 228
and classification debate 58–9
and reservations to human rights treaties 266, 279, 280, 288, 303–8
European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) 59, 63, 228, 273–4, 275, 279–81, 290, 298, 303, 307
European Court of Justice (ECJ) 228
expression of consent to be bound 5, 6, 71, 99–153
contractual relationship 17
deformalization and return to formalism 141–7, 328
and delegation of rule-making authority to treaty bodies 115, 133, 134
evolution of modalities for 99–113
individualism versus communitarianism 100, 101, 113
informality, move towards ‘any other means’ caveat in the VCLT 104–7
majority voting see majority voting
new processes for 113–47
outer limits of informality in the consensualist paradigm 116–47
sociopolitical background of new means 113–16
one-step process and theory of remote/general consent 126–41
decisions adopted on basis of unanimity or consensus 127–32
whether consensualist paradigm preserved 127–32
opting-out technique 118–26
traditional contours of Article 11
VCLT 107–13
acte contraire doctrine 108–12
formality, presumption of 108–12
North Sea Continental Shelf
dictum 109–12
traditional means of consent 124
treaty-making process 99, 114, 116, 122–4, 126, 127, 133, 135, 142, 147, 149, 151, 153
VCLT, Article 11 122–6
whether preserved 127–32
whether remote consent theory consistent with 139–41
see also consent/State consent
Federal Republic of Germany (FRG) 110, 218
Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY) 213, 219–20
case law 221–7
Fitzmaurice, G. 47–8, 52, 91, 160
flexibility and formalism 101–3, 147
only on condition of common agreement of States parties 112–13
soft law 77, 78, 79
flexibilization 9, 80, 103, 152, 199, 324
of consensualist paradigm 5, 6, 152
formalism 5–6, 9, 24, 153, 173, 193, 206, 231, 232, 281, 321, 322, 329
backlash towards 81, 124, 147, 153, 231, 328
content 89–90
deformalization 141–7, 328
expression of consent to be bound evolution of modalities for 103, 106, 108, 112
new processes for 124, 125, 141
and flexibility 101–3, 147
and law of treaties 16, 88–95
return to 141–7, 187–8, 231, 328
treaty concept 82, 89, 91
in VCSST 193, 206
whether VCLT formalistic in nature 106–7
FRY see Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY)
Gabčíkovo–Nagymaros case 20–1, 166, 211
General Assembly Official Records (GAOR) 273
Geneva Conventions (1949) 49, 159, 228, 229
automatic succession doctrine 209, 221–8
humanizing purpose 239
ICJ Advisory Opinion on reservations (1951) 49–50, 236, 237–45, 248, 271, 287
reservations to 234, 237–48, 259, 260, 286–8, 291–3
role of UNGA 61
special nature 224
German Democratic Republic (GDR) 218
Giraud, E. 159
Harvard Draft on the Law of Treaties (1935) 20, 91
expression of consent to be bound 104
withdrawal from treaties 154, 158, 161
Havana Convention on Treaties 158
Herndl, K. 213
High Contracting Parties 59, 62
Hudson, M. 73
human rights bodies 217, 259, 315, 322
automatic succession doctrine 232, 233
dialogue réservatoire, role in 317–18
Fifth Meeting of Persons Chairing 213
imperialist motives of bodies and tribunals 295–6
implied powers doctrine 326
monitoring bodies see monitoring bodies
and reservations to human rights treaties 271, 274, 280, 290, 291, 303, 311
see also human rights treaties
Human Rights Committee (HRCttee)
176, 177, 180, 181, 209, 210, 212, 213, 215, 217, 219, 267, 272–8, 284–5, 288–9, 294, 301, 308–10, 315, 317
General Comment 24 (GC24) 273, 277, 328
General Comment 26 (GC26) 176, 179, 209, 210, 212, 229, 327–8
human rights treaties 49
automatic succession doctrine 207–12
dispute settlement clauses as fundamental object/essence of
292–4
institutionalized environment 60, 325–8
integrity 185–6, 211, 237–8, 241, 246, 248, 265, 276, 294–5, 310, 313
object and purpose see object and purpose test
reservations and State consent 234–70
specific traits 58–62
withdrawal from 174, 175–80
see also automatic succession doctrine; human rights bodies
I-ACtHR see Inter-American Court of Human Rights (I-ACtHR)
ICAO see International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO)
ICCPR see International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)
ICJ Advisory Opinion on reservations (1951) 49–50, 236, 237–45, 248, 271, 287
non-reciprocal nature 246
object and purpose test 225
identity of treaties conclusions on 95
manipulation of 70, 79
shaping in reference to other sources of international law 68–82
shift from treaties to soft law 68, 76–82
ILC see International Law Commission (ILC)
implied powers doctrine 326
individualism versus communitarianism in expression of consent to be bound 100, 101, 113
fluctuation between 15–19, 22
see also binary and transformational analysis; communitarian considerations
informality move towards ‘any other means’ caveat in the VCLT 104–7
outer limits of, in the consensualist paradigm 116–47
opting-out technique 118–26
institutionalization of treaty regimes 4, 5, 7, 57, 60, 62, 87, 147
trend towards 325
instrumentum, treaty as 5, 54
binary and transformational analysis 27–30
reciprocity 85
Inter-American Court of Human Rights (I-ACtHR) 59, 155, 176, 185, 242, 274, 308
and reservations to human rights treaties 241–3
and withdrawal from optional clauses and protocols 174, 182, 183, 184
Inter-American system 59
International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) 168
Safeguards Agreement with 169, 172
International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) 127
Council 119, 120
International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) 207
International Convention for the Safety of Life at Sea (SOLAS, 1974) 121, 126
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) 176, 288, 314
International Court of Justice (ICJ)
Advisory Opinion on reservations to Genocide Convention (1951) 49–50, 236–45, 248, 271, 287
on conundrum between compatibility and opposability 259–61
Congo v. Rwanda 228, 259, 260, 282, 287, 291–3
and formalism 91–3
Gabčíkovo-Nagyamaros 20–21, 166, 211
optional clause 183–4, 288, 290, 293
Qatar v. Bahrain 25–6, 93–4
and South West Africa 129
Statute 129, 183, 221, 290
Yugoslavian cases before 221–7
Legality of Use of Force 224, 226, 259, 260
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) 87, 174–7, 213, 219, 267–9, 272, 278, 280–81, 288
First Optional Protocol 155, 180–81, 212, 266, 289, 305, 308, 310
North Korea’s attempt to withdraw from 155, 175–6
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) 175, 187
International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) 228
International Health Regulations (IHR) 314
International Law Association (ILA) 137, 194, 201
Committee on Aspects of the Law of State Succession 229
International Law Commission (ILC) codification project 36, 45, 47–58
drafting committee 162
Final Draft on State Succession to Treaties 196, 199, 202, 204
Guidelines on reservations 256–9, 328
international legal order 34, 113, 154, 186, 187, 195, 232, 265, 324, 325
and sources of international law 68–72, 77, 78, 80
International Maritime Organization (IMO) 120
International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (ITLOS) 138
ipso jure succession 204, 205, 215, 216
Ireland v. United Kingdom case 63, 66
ius inter partes 40
Ivcher Bronstein case 60, 181, 185, 186, 290–91, 294–5
Jellinek, G. 35, 191
Jenks, W.C. 192, 199–202
Kazakhstan 219
Kelsen, H. 35–6
Kennedy, D. 14, 67
Klabbers, J. 301
Koskenniemi, M. 152, 173
Kratochwil, F. 140
Kyoto Protocol non-compliance procedure 143–6
Lauterpacht, H. 24–5, 36, 42–3, 65, 300
Law of the Sea Conventions (1958) 110, 160
see also United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS)
law of treaties binary and transformational analysis see binary and transformational analysis
consensual approach 15–16
doctrinal analysis 16–17
expression of consent 9
and formalism 16, 88–95
reciprocity, role of 82–8
rules 7–8
sociopolitical considerations 85, 113–16
and soft law
State intent
studies

see also law-making treaties
law-making treaties
classification debate
and clean slate doctrine
law-making character
reciprocity

see also contractual treaties; treaties
League of Nations
legal expectations doctrine
legality of use of force case
lex specialis
effort to introduce a subject matter lex specialis
linear analysis, limitations
living instrument concept
Loizidou case
London Declaration (1871)

majority voting
and expression of consent to be bound
remote/general consent theory
supermajority
Maritime Safety Committee
MARPOL
McNair, A.
MEAs
MEAs see multilateral environmental agreements (MEAs)
Memorandum on Mutual Understanding on Issues of Succession to Treaties of the Former USSR Having Mutual Interest (6 July 1992)
monitoring bodies
implied powers doctrine
reservations, human rights treaties

Montreal Protocol
multilateral environmental agreements
remote/general consent theory
multilateral treaties
shift from customary international law to
municipal law analogies

nature of treaties
binding
human rights treaties
negativist thesis, State succession
negotium, treaty as
binary and transformational analysis
classification debate
reciprocity
non-compliance mechanism
North Korea
attempt to withdraw from ICCPR
withdrawal from NPT
North Sea Continental Shelf cases
NPT see Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT)

object and purpose test
classification debate
compatibility versus opposability
conundrum
ICJ on
constructing, with regard to reservations to jurisdictional clauses
dispute settlement clauses/protocols
as fundamental object/essence of human rights treaties
Genocide Convention
ICJ Advisory Opinion (1951)
introduction of
objections linked to
Index

objective nature 250, 255, 260
permissibility/compatibility thesis 251–2, 254
’real’ object and purpose of human rights treaties 295–6
reciprocity 87
and system of acceptances/objections 251–61
compatibility versus opposability conundrum 254–6
ICJ on conundrum between compatibility and opposability 259–61
ILC guidelines on reservations 256–9
see also reservations, human rights treaties
O’Connell, D.P. 200–201
Office of Legal Affairs (OLA) 149, 272, 273
one-step processes, and theory of remote/general consent 126–41
majority voting 133–8
whether remote consent theory consistent with consensualist paradigm of Article 11 VCLT 139–41
opting-out technique 118–22, 235
and Article 11 of VCLT 122–6
and quorum technique 118
ordre public 307
Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) 143
Organizations of American States (OAS) 178, 236
oscillation 3, 6, 8, 9, 14, 19, 25, 27, 30, 34, 81, 142, 193, 216, 246–7, 322
binary and transformational analysis in law of treaties 19, 22, 24–5
between communication and autonomy 27
critical approach to international treaty law 14–5
between esoteric intention and external manifestations 24
expression of consent to be bound 103, 106, 142, 149
between form and content 25, 27
public order treaties, succession to 190, 193–4, 196
reservations, human rights treaties 246, 308, 314, 322
theoretical background to State treaties 30, 32
treaty withdrawal cases 158, 162, 166, 172–3, 181, 184–5
pacta sunt servanda principle
binary and transformational analysis 19–21
and rebus sic stantibus 19–21
reciprocity 85
and reservations 249
and withdrawal cases 156–7
Pan-American Union 235–6, 240
PCIJ see Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ)
Pellet, A. 271, 312
Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ) 92, 167, 210
Advisory Opinion on Access to German Minority Schools in Upper Silesia (1931) 129
Advisory Opinion on Certain Questions Relating to Settlers of German Origin in the Territory Ceded by Germany to Poland (1923) 210
Advisory Opinion on Railway Traffic between Lithuania and Poland (1931) 128–9
Peru 181
positivism/positive law 40, 79
pragmatism 193–4, 231, 319
process and content, tension between 30
public order treaties, succession 189–233
automatic succession doctrine see automatic succession doctrine
ipso jure succession 204, 205, 215
right to continuity 189, 191, 193, 195–203, 205, 218–20, 227–8, 230
State succession question, theory 189–94
The paradigm of State consent in the law of treaties

VCSST see Vienna Convention on Succession of States in Respect of Treaties (VCSST)

Qatar v. Bahrain case 25–6, 93–4

quorum technique 118

ratification of treaties 45, 80, 300

Rawle Kennedy case 181, 289, 309, 310

rebus sic stantibus, exception of 19–20, 21

reciprocity and classification debate 42, 45, 47, 48

and communitarianism 84

consequences of acceptances/objections to reservations under the VCLT 263–5

in human rights treaties, absence of 60, 241–2, 246

when reacting to reservations to human rights treaties 265–70

international legal order 84–5

material 86

and question of bilateralization 84, 87, 246, 263–5

place in Vienna rules on reservations 263–70

role in law of treaties 82–8

in the treaty enforcement phase 86–7

regional human rights courts 275, 276

remote/general consent theory 126–42

decisions adopted on basis of unanimity or consensus 127–32

majority voting 133–8

and one-step processes 126–42

whether theory consistent with consensualist paradigm of Article 11 VCLT 139–41

res inter alios acta maxim 201

reservations, human rights treaties

acceptances and objections, Vienna rules on consequences of 263–5

case law on reservations to optional clauses and protocols 286–94

dispute settlement clauses/protocols as fundamental

object/essence of human rights treaties 292–4

exclusive versus complementary nature of dispute settlement clauses 291–2

optional versus compulsory nature of dispute settlement clauses 288–91

compatibility/permissibility/admissibility thesis 251–2, 254–5

consensualist paradigm, challenging 270–314
dialogue réservatoire 314–21

and human rights bodies 271, 274, 280, 290–91, 303, 311

ICJ Advisory Opinion (1951) 236–45, 248, 271

ideal of integrity 237–8, 241, 246, 253, 255, 265, 294–5, 310

ideal of universality 238–43

introducing a subject matter lex specialis on 261–3

object and purpose test see object and purpose test

opposability thesis 252, 256

preliminary conclusions 245–8

reactions to, by contracting parties 235–6, 239–40, 243, 254–6,


legal value of 254, 256, 276–83, 318–21

reciprocity, place in Vienna rules 263–70

reciprocity and bilateralization problem 264–5

Vienna rules on consequences of acceptances/objections to reservations 263–5

severability doctrine 296–314

theoretical analysis 234–7

treaty bodies versus State bodies in determining compatibility

272–86

validity, logic of 251

abandonment 315–16

Rwanda 228
scientific uncertainty 102, 115
sectoral regimes 30
Selbstverpflichtungslehre (self-limitation theory) 35, 191
self and the community, fundamental tension between 14
binary and transformational character of tension 15–16
egotism and cooperation/community 16, 17–21
self-determination 192
Serbia 226
severability doctrine 5, 296–314
see also reservations, human rights treaties
Simma, B. 72, 168, 268–9
simplified amendment procedures 116–21, 124, 125, 142
Sinclair, I., Sir 26
Slovenia 217
Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (SFRY) 193, 213, 219–20, 222, 223
socialization process 14, 17, 35, 66
socialization of States 83–4
soft law
advantages, as compared to treaties 77–9, 80, 82
categories 74
and communitarian discourse 79
defining and delineating from treaties 73–6
flexibility 77, 78, 79
formalism and law of treaties 90–95
and heterogeneity of States 76, 77
informal nature 77, 81
international legal order 80
non-binding engagements 75
scientific uncertainty 76–7
shift from treaties to 68, 73–82
lessons for identity of treaties 76–82
soft instruments 74, 75
turn to 81
SOLAS (International Convention for the Safety of Life at Sea, 1974) 121, 126
sources of international law
concept 68–9
formal 68–9
material 69
shaping of treaty identity in reference to 68–82
South Africa, Mandate over South West Africa 129–30
sovereignty
and clean slate doctrine 190–91
sovereign autonomy 100, 141
sovereignist conception of international law 72
and treaty denunciation 155
see also State sovereignty
Soviet Union (USSR) 218
State consent see consent/State consent
State intent 22, 24
esoteric and constructed intent, fluctuation between 22–7
State sovereignty 325, 327
clean slate doctrine 196, 197, 200
and consensualism 234
expression of consent to be bound 124, 140
reservations question 234–6
State volition 41, 131, 284
binary and transformational analysis 18, 19, 22, 23
see also State will
State will 3, 4, 16
bare will 5, 18, 22, 27
constraints on 18–19
formalism 89
and subjectivism 23–4
see also State volition; will theory
States
common agreement of parties 112–13
compatibility of reservations, reactions to 276–86
egoistical interests of 3, 17–18, 35, 50, 57, 83
equality 66
heterogeneity of 76, 77
intent see State intent
non-performing 50–51
participation in treaty life 7–8, 66, 174, 179, 186–8, 232–3, 247,
The paradigm of State consent in the law of treaties

270, 281, 315, 317–21, 325, 327–9
socialization of 14, 17, 35, 66, 83–4
sovereignty see State sovereignty
volition see State volition
will see State will
Stern, B. 215
subjectivism 23–4, 65
shortcomings of subjective exception to non-denunciable treaties 163–4
subjective and objective tests 5
succession to public order treaties see public order treaties, succession
superposition strategy 281
symbolic struggles 38
tacit agreement/consent 91, 118–26, 162, 279
tacit amendment 5, 124, 126
teleological interpretation of treaties 60
Temeltasch case 279, 285, 286
Tomuschat, C. 151, 304
treaties
advantages 71–3
bilateral 46, 48, 50, 53, 64, 72
binding nature of 18, 19, 24
intention of parties 75–6
classification of see classification debate
‘collective interest’ 58, 62, 66–7, 81, 82, 324
communitarian aspect see communitarian considerations
concept of 4, 34–98
classification debate 34–67
deformalization 88
discursive shifts in international law influencing 70
reconstruction 34–98
traditional perceptions 2, 4, 9, 38, 53, 57, 64, 68, 82–95
consensual and contractual traits 28
disadvantages 73–82
dual hypostasis, enclosed in 34
identity see identity of treaties
institutionalization of treaty regimes 4, 5, 7, 62, 87, 147
interpretation 60
in interwar period 36
law of see law of treaties
as law-making technique in international legal order 70
legislative versus contractual types 35–6, 37, 39, 42–7, 52–3, 54, 64, 65
multilateral 46, 48, 53, 54, 68, 265
shift from customary international law to 71–3
obligations
bilateralizable 48, 50, 51, 236, 265
human rights 49
integral 51, 60, 94
interdependent 48–9, 51
reciprocal effects of specific obligations 48
plurilateral 48
ratification see ratification of treaties
reconstruction of concept 34–98
soft content 74
soft law, shift to 68, 73–82
theoretical background see theoretical background to State treaties
traditional perceptions of concept 2, 9, 38, 53, 57, 64, 68
essential traits of ‘traditional’ concept 82–95
treaty as instrumentum (form/procedure) 5, 27–30, 54, 85
treaty as negotium (substance/content) 5, 27–30, 43, 44, 54, 85
treaty bodies, human rights see human rights bodies
treaty-making process see treaty-making process
tripartite distinction 48, 51
written form 71
treaty concept see treaties
Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT) 187
Conference of the Parties to 174
Index

withdrawal from 154, 167–74
- Vienna Convention on Succession of States in Respect of Treaties (VCSST) 2, 189
  - Article 2 195
  - Article 4 189
  - Article 11 196, 210
  - Article 12 196, 210, 211
  - Article 17 189
  - Article 20 197–8
  - Article 22 197
  - Article 23 197–8
  - Article 34 189, 196, 206–7, 227, 229
  - exceptions provided in 206
  - clean slate doctrine see clean slate doctrine
- Triepel, H. 35, 40–41, 42
- Trinidad and Tobago 289, 310
- withdrawal from ACHR 174, 178

Vienna Convention on Succession of States in Respect of Treaties (VCSST) 2, 189
- Article 2 195
- Article 4 189
- Article 11 196, 210
- Article 12 196, 210, 211
- Article 17 189
- Article 20 197–8
- Article 22 197
- Article 23 197–8
- Article 34 189, 196, 206–7, 227, 229
- exceptions provided in 206
- clean slate doctrine see clean slate doctrine

Ulfstein, G. 147
- unilateralism 23, 66
- United Nations Charter 163
- United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) 121, 144, 148, 149
- United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) 61, 239, 267, 273
- United Nations Security Council (UNSC) 169, 170, 221, 247–8
- Ušakov, N. 201

Ulfstein, G. 147
- unilateralism 23, 66
- United Nations Charter 163
- United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) 121, 144, 148, 149
- United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) 61, 239, 267, 273
- United Nations Security Council (UNSC) 169, 170, 221, 247–8
- Ušakov, N. 201

VCLT see Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT)

Venezuela, withdrawal from ACHR 174, 178

vested or acquired rights, theory of 209–12

veto power 249

Vienna Conference on the Law of Treaties 105, 162, 252–3, 263

Vienna Conference on the Whole 202–3

Vienna Convention on Consular Rights, Optional Protocol 186

Vassilis Pergantis - 9781786432230
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 05/03/2019 08:48:19AM
via free access
The paradigm of State consent in the law of treaties

Article 21 254–5, 263, 265, 267–8, 296–7
and classification debate 46
denunciation, rules on (Articles 54
and 56) 154, 155, 157–67, 172, 175, 179, 185
appraisal of rules 163–7
emergence of an ‘objective’
exception 164–5
emergence of rules 157–63
impossible streamlining (Article
56) 165–7
shortcomings of subjective
exception 163–4
general regime 30
residual/dispositive regime 3, 29, 46,
55, 88, 267
Vienna regime 2, 5, 30, 65, 88, 91, 251,
328
see also Vienna Convention on
Succession of States in Respect
of Treaties (VCSST); Vienna
Convention on the Law of
Treaties between States and
International Organizations;
Vienna Convention on the Law
of Treaties (VCLT)
volutarist theories 35
voting 122, 127, 131
majority 116, 123, 133–8, 139, 141,
142, 148, 149, 151
one-step process and theory of
remote/general consent 123,
126, 133–8, 139
supermajority 136
unanimous 118, 127–32, 249
veto power 249

Waldock, H. 52, 161, 196–7, 249, 261–2
will theory 15
acts of will 39–40
autonomy of will 24, 42, 64, 100, 106,
113, 141, 190, 191
bare will 5, 18, 22, 27
collective will 18
declarations of will 41, 100–101
external manifestations of will 101
merger of wills 65
reciprocity 83
State will see State will
subordination of individual will to the
Gemeinwille 42
withdrawal from treaties
and collective interest treaties 186,
324
and contracting parties’ reactions to
156, 160, 167, 174, 176, 188
current discourse on 167–86
formalism, return to 142
general rule of non-denunciability
163
Harvard Draft on the Law of Treaties
(1935) 154, 158, 161
human rights treaties 174, 175–80
non-denunciability, exception of 159
optional clauses and protocols
180–86
optional versus compulsory
jurisdictional clauses 181
and pacta sunt servanda principle
156, 157
presumption of non-denunciability
162, 177, 179
prohibition of 5
State consent in 154–88
theory 155–7
Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of
Nuclear Weapons (NPT) 167–74
unconditional right of 159
VCLT rules on denunciation (Articles
54 and 56) 154, 155, 157–67,
172, 175, 179, 185
appraisal of rules 163–7
emergence of an ‘objective’
exception 164–5
emergence of rules 157–63
impossible streamlining (Article
56) 165–7
shortcomings of subjective
exception 163–4
whether participatory solution to
conundrum of 186–8
World Court 128
World Health Organization (WHO) 119