

# Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Introduction</i>	x
1. The ‘mechanics’ of effective legislation	1
1. Introduction: on lawmaking and lawmakers	1
2. Any principles to guide lawmaking?	4
3. Efficacy, effectiveness or efficiency?	9
4. The fundamental elements of effectiveness	12
4.1. Purpose of legislation: the benchmark of effectiveness	13
4.2. Content of legislation: the ‘heart’ of effectiveness	14
4.3. Overarching structure or superstructure: the context of effectiveness	15
4.4. Results of legislation: the ‘measure’ of effectiveness	15
4.5. Interaction between the elements	16
5. Conclusion: the lawmaker as the ‘designer’ of effective laws and the effectiveness test as a thinking process	16
2. Legislation and its purpose	17
1. Purpose in the life cycle of legislation	17
2. Challenges for lawmakers	18
2.1. The unclear boundaries between reasons, justification and goals	18
2.2. What objectives?	20
2.3. The vague language of legislative objectives	22
2.4. The location of legislative objectives	25
2.5. Too much information on objectives	30
3. Purpose and objectives in effective lawmaking	33
3.1. Objectives need to be the starting point in lawmaking	34
3.2. Specific, measurable and well-formulated objectives	35

3.3. Objectives as benchmarks	36
3.4. Traceable objectives	37
4. Conclusions: purpose as a benchmark for effectiveness	39
3. The content of legislation	40
1. Lawmaking challenges when designing the content of legislation	40
1.1. Selecting substantive rules	41
1.2. Compliance and enforcement	45
1.3. Communicating the law	48
2. Effective legislative mechanics	51
2.1. A clear legislative strategy	52
2.2. Clear mechanics	53
2.3. Choices informed by evidence but selected on the basis of effectiveness	54
2.4. Anticipating compliance	57
2.5. Consideration of enforcement and implementation	58
2.6. Clear messages for clear communication	59
2.7. Experimentation	60
3. Conclusions: the importance of legislative design	61
4. Legislation and its context	64
1. Why context matters	64
2. Superstructure and the transmission of legislative messages	66
2.1. The ‘all-in-one’ message	67
2.2. ‘Diffuse’ messages	69
2.3. ‘Fragmented’ messages	71
2.4. ‘Patchwork’ messages	74
2.5. Delivery options and their implications	78
3. Delivering the message effectively	79
3.1. Informed choices on superstructure	79
3.2. Accessibility	80
3.3. Coherence	81
3.4. Consider how the changes will be appraised	82
4. Conclusion	83
5. The implementation of the law: results, impact and effectiveness	84

1. Legislation, results and lawmaking	84
2. Challenges for lawmakers	85
2.1. What kind of results does legislation produce?	85
2.2. How can results be anticipated and measured?	87
2.3. Review	89
2.4. Horizontal questions: when, how and who will record and measure results?	98
3. Results in effective lawmaking	101
3.1. Clearly defined results	101
3.2. Anticipating implementation	102
3.3. A clear monitoring, review and evaluation framework	103
3.4. Clear and specific monitoring, review and evaluation clauses	104
4. Conclusions	107
6. Which tools for effective lawmaking?	108
1. Introduction	108
2. On toolkits, tools and lawmaking	109
3. A closer look at the contemporary lawmaking toolkit from the perspective of effective lawmaking	112
3.1. Impact assessment	112
3.2. Consultation	116
3.3. So, does the toolkit contribute to lawmaking?	118
4. Adding ‘effectiveness lenses’ to existing tools: the effectiveness test	119
4.1. The effectiveness test	120
4.2. The structure and elements of the ‘effectiveness test’	121
4.3. ‘Testing’ the effectiveness test: three case studies	124
4.4. Usefulness, relevance, advantages and limitations	127
5. Conclusions	128
7. Legislative failure	129
1. Failure and legislation	129
1.1. Understanding failure	130
1.2. A typology of legislative failure	131
1.3. The timing and actors of a diagnosis of failure	136
2. Responding to failure	137

2.1.	Amendments: a panacea or a curse?	137
2.2.	Simplification	139
2.3.	Codification	140
2.4.	Law reform – looking at the whole picture	141
2.5.	Effectiveness of the responses	143
3.	Anticipating and avoiding future failure	143
3.1.	Strategic approach to the diagnosis and analysis of legislative failure	144
3.2.	Strengthen the ‘immune’ system of the legal order	146
3.3.	Learn from failure	147
3.4.	Invest in effective lawmaking	149
4.	Conclusion	149
8.	On lawmakers, lawmaking and effectiveness	150
1.	So what about effectiveness?	150
2.	Lawmaking in practice: top down or bottom up?	155
3.	A typology of lawmakers?	156
3.1.	The intuitive lawmaker	157
3.2.	The reflective lawmaker	157
3.3.	The lawmaker that ‘muddles through’	158
4.	Cognitive biases in lawmaking?	158
4.1.	Legislative styles, drafting conventions and regulatory culture	159
4.2.	Path dependence, habitual action and legislative ‘patterns’	160
4.3.	Borrowed, imported and supranational rules	162
5.	Effective lawmaking	163
	Bibliography	164
	<i>Index</i>	191