

# Table of cases

---

## Australia

AAT Case 8769 (1993) 26 ATR 1051 .....	135
Brooks v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (2000) 2000 ATC 4362 .....	123
Californian Oil Products Ltd (in liq) v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1934) 52 CLR 28 .....	115
Case 26/93 93 ATC 320, 322 .....	135
Collis v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1996) 96 ATC 4831 .....	131
Couch v FC of T (2009) ATC 10-072; [2009] AATA 41 .....	135
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Guy (1996) 96 ATC 4520 .....	123
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v McNeil [2007] HCA 5 .....	123
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Macquarie Bank Ltd [2013] FCAFC 13 .....	23, 137
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Orica Ltd (1998) 194 CLR 500; 98 ATC 4494 .....	120
Federal Commissioner of Taxation v Woite (1982) 13 ATR 579 .....	113, 115
Granby Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1995) 95 ATC 4240 .....	131
Hepples v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1991) 91 ATC 4808 .....	119
Kinsella v Revenue Commissioners [2007] IEHC 250, 10 ITLR 63 .....	102
Thiel v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1990) 94 ALR 647, (1990) 171 CLR 338 ..	92, 97, 104
Undershaft (No 1) Ltd v Commissioner of Taxation [2009] FCA 41, 11 ITLR 652 .....	102
Virgin Holdings SA v Commissioner of Taxation [2008] FCA 1503, 11 ITLR 335 .....	101–3

## Canada

Antle v Canada 2009 TCC 465, 2009 DTC 1305, 2010 FCA 280, 2010 DTC 5172.....	165
Canada v MIL (Investments) SA 2007 FCA 236, 2007 DTC 5437 .....	165
Canada v Sommerer 2012 FCA 207, [2014] 1 FCR 379 .....	165
Canada v Stirling [1985] 1 FC 342, 85 DTC 5199 .....	158
Carsons Camps Ltd v Canada 84 DTC 6070, [1984] CTC 46 .....	144
Cockshutt Farm Equipment of Canada v Minister of National Revenue (1966) 41 Tax ABC 386, 66 DTC 544 .....	158
Diamond Developments Ltd v Minister of National Revenue 84 DTC 1811, [1984] CTC 2992 .....	144
First Investors Corporation Ltd v Canada 87 DTC 5176, [1987] 1 CTC 285 .....	144

Friesen v Canada [1995] 3 SCR 103, 95 DTC 5551 .....	153
Fundy Settlement v Canada 2012 SCC 14, [2012] 1 SCR 520 .....	165
Gratl v Canada 94 DTC 6255, [1994] 2 CTC 1 .....	143
H Fine & Sons Ltd v Canada 84 DTC 6520, [1984] CTC 500 .....	143
Hiwako Investments Ltd v Canada 78 DTC 6281, [1978] CTC 378 .....	144
Irrigation Industries Ltd v Minister of National Revenue [1962] SCR 346, 62 DTC 1131, 352 .....	144-5
Jack Dichter Developments Ltd v Minister of National Revenue 79 DTC 608, [1979] CTC 2706 .....	144
King Edward Hotel (Calgary) Ltd v Minister of National Revenue 90 DTC 6468, [1990] 2 CTC 214 .....	144
Ludco Enterprises Ltd v Minister of National Revenue 2001 SCC 62, [2001] 2 SCR 1082 .....	166
McDonald v Canada 74 DTC 6644, [1974] CTC 836 .....	143
MacDonald v Minister of National Revenue 84 DTC 1602, [1984] CTC 2624 .....	158
MacDonald v The Queen 2012 TCC 123, 2012 DTC 1145 .....	163
Manrell v Canada [2003] 3 CTC 50, 2003 DTC 5225 .....	154
Minister of National Revenue v Spooner [1933] AC 684, 1 DTC 258 .....	143
Minister of National Revenue v Taylor [1956] CTC 189, 56 DTC 1125 .....	143
Minister of National Revenue v Wain-Town Gas and Oil Co Ltd [1952] 2 SCR 377, 52 DTC 1138 .....	143
Pappas Estate v Canada 81 DTC 5178, [1981] CTC 266 .....	158
Regal Heights Ltd v Minister of National Revenue [1960] SCR 902, 60 DTC 1270 .....	144
Rivermede Developments Ltd v Minister of National Revenue 93 DTC 5365, [1993] 2 CTC 220 .....	144
Saskatchewan Wheat Pool v Canada 2008 TCC 8, 2008 DTC 2520 .....	144
Schwartz v Canada [1996] 1 SCR 254, 96 DTC 6103 .....	152
Shaw v Minister of National Revenue [1939] SCR 338, [1938-39] CTC 346, 342 .....	142
Slater v Minister of National Revenue [1966] Ex CR 387, 66 DTC 5047 .....	144
Smythe v Minister of National Revenue [1970] SCR 64, 69 DTC 5361 .....	145
Walton v Canada 82 DTC 6220, [1982] CTC 228 .....	144

## India

Ali v Commissioner of Income Tax (2014) 360 ITR 200 .....	213
Armstrong World Industries Mauritius Multiconsult Ltd (2012) 349 ITR 303 .....	220
BASF Aktiengesellschaft v Deputy Director of Income-tax (International Taxation) [2007] 293 ITR (AT) 1 .....	218
Bhatia Nagar Premises Co-operative Society Ltd v Union of India [2010] 334 ITR 145 .....	217
Cairn UK Holdings Ltd v Director of Income-tax [2013] 38 taxmann.com 179 .....	218
Commissioner of Income-tax v B C Srinivasa Setty [1981] 128 ITR 294 .....	216
Commissioner of Income-tax v Gita Duggal (2013) 357 ITR 153 .....	222

Commissioner of Income-tax v Maheshwari Devi Jute Mills Ltd (1965) 57 ITR 36 .....	212
Commissioner of Income-tax v Poddar (1984) 148 ITR 506 .....	213
Commissioner of Income-tax v Wadia (1995) 216 ITR 376 .....	222
Deputy Director of Income-tax v Safmarine Container Lines NV (2009) 19 DTR .....	219
Director of Income-tax v Copal Research Ltd [2014-TII-47-HC-DEL-INTL] .....	231
Escorts Farms (Ramgarh) Ltd v Commissioner of Income Tax [1996] 222 ITR 509 .....	216
Fidelity North Star Fund [2007] 288 ITR 641 .....	223
IBM World Trade Corporation v Deputy Director of Income Tax [2012] 148 TTJ 496 .....	219–20
Income-tax Officer v Parmar (1985) 11 ITD 237 .....	213
Kapadia v Commissioner of Income-tax [1967] 63 ITR 651 .....	216
LG Asian Plus Ltd v ADIT [2011] 46 SOT 159 .....	223
Mauritiu, Re (2012) 343 ITR 455 .....	220
Modi v Commissioner of Income-tax (1966) 61 ITR 428 .....	212
Palanisamy v Union of India [2008] 306 ITR 61 .....	217
Pawan Arya v Commissioner of Income Tax (2011) 49 DTR 123 .....	222
Prudential Assurance Co Ltd v Assistant Director of Income Tax [2012-TII-254-ITAT-MUM-INTL] .....	220
Sanofi Pasteur Holding SA v Department of Revenue [2013] 213 Taxman 504 .....	231
Shah v Commissioner of Income-tax (1985) 156 ITR 448 .....	213
Shiva Kant Jha v Union of India (2002) 256 ITR 563 .....	225
Singhji v Commissioner of Income-tax (1976) 103 ITR 61 .....	213
Timken France SAS [2007] 294 ITR 513 .....	218
Union of India v Azadi Bachao Andolan [2004] 10 SCC 1 .....	225
Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd [2005] 274 ITR 434 .....	219
Vodafone International Holdings v Union of India [2012-TII-01-SC-LB-INTL] .....	229
Vodafone International Holdings BV v Union of India [2010] 329 ITR 126 .....	228–9, 233
XYZ/ABC Equity Fund (2002) 250 ITR 194 .....	222–3

## **New Zealand**

AA Finance Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (1994) 16 NZTC 11, 383 .....	291
Ben Nevis Forestry Ventures Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [2008] NZSC 115, [2009] 2 NZLR 289 .....	307
BP Australia Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1965) 112 CLR 386 (PC) 397 .....	300–1
Californian Copper Syndicate v Harris (1904) 5 TC 159 .....	291
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Auckland Harbour Board [2001] 3 NZLR 289 (PC), (2001) 20 NZTC 17,008 .....	305

Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Farmers' Trading Co Ltd [1982] 1 NZLR 449 .....	304
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Fraser (1996) 17 NZTC 12,607 .....	286, 300–1, 303
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Hunter [1970] NZLR 116 .....	296
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v McKenzies (1988) 10 NZTC 5,233 .....	302
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v National Distributors Ltd [1989] 2 NZLR 661 (CA) 668 .....	299
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v United Dominions Trust Ltd (1973) 1 NZTC 61, 028 .....	108
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Walker [1963] NZLR 339 .....	296
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Wattie [1999] 1 NZLR 529 .....	302–3
Hallstroms Pty Ltd v Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1946) 72 CLR 634 .....	302
Henwood v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (1995) 17 NZTC 12,271 .....	286, 300–1, 303
Holden v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [1974] 2 NZLR 52 .....	296
King v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (2006) 22 NZTC 19,691 .....	299
Lowe v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [1981] 1 NZLR 326 .....	294, 296
Minister of National Revenue v Tara Exploration and Development Co Ltd (1972) 28 DLR (3d) 135 .....	97
National Insurance Company of New Zealand Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue (1997) 18 NZTC 13,489 .....	291
Penny v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [2011] NZSC 95, [2012] 1 NZLR 43 .....	307
Plimmer v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [1958] NZLR 147 (SC) 151 ...	295
Stockwell v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [1993] 2 NZLR 40 .....	299
Whiterock Estate Co (Ltd) v Commissioner of Taxes [1911] NZLR 405 .....	295

## South Africa

Cohen v Commissioner for Inland Revenue (1946) 13 SATC 362 .....	325
Commissioner for Inland Revenue v Estate CP Crewe 1943 AD 656, 12 SATC 344, 352 .....	317
Commissioner for Inland Revenue v Kuttel (1992) 54 SATC 298 .....	325
Commissioner for South African Revenue Service v Tradehold Ltd [2012] ZASCA 61, [2012] 73 SATC 1848 .....	326
Executors of Paterson v Webster, Steel & Co (1880–1882) 1 SC 350, 355 ...	321
Kirsh Industries Ltd v Vosloo & Lindeque 1982 (3) SA 479 .....	321
ITC 1793 (2005) 67 SATC 256 .....	320
ITC 1835 (2008) 71 SATC 105 .....	320
Natal Estates Ltd v Secretary for Inland Revenue (1975) 37 SATC 193 .....	320
Standard Bank v Wentzel & Lombard 1904 TS 828, 833–34 .....	321
Wagstaff & Elston v Carter & Talbot 1909 TS 121 .....	321
Whitlock v Rolfes, Nebel & Co 1911 WLD 35 .....	321

**United Kingdom**

Batey v Wakefield [1981] STC 521 .....	355
BMBF v Mawson [2003] STC 66 .....	339
Case 371/10, National Grid Indus BV v Inspecteur van de Belastingdienst Rijnmond/kantoor Rotterdam ECLI:EU:C:2011:785 .....	354
Case C-646/15, Trustees of P Panayi Accumulation & Maintenance Settlements v Commissioners for Her Majesty's Revenue & Customs .....	354
Craven v White [1988] STC 476 .....	339
DTE Financial Services v Wilson [2001] STC 777 .....	339
Ensign Tankers Leasing Ltd v Stokes [1992] STC 226 .....	339
Fitzwilliam v IRC [1993] STC 502 .....	339
Frost v Feltham [1981] STC 115 .....	354
Furniss v Dawson [1984] STC 153 .....	339
Griffin v Craig-Harvey [1994] STC 54 .....	354
HMRC v Smallwood [2010] EWCA Civ 778 .....	354
IRC v McGuckian [1997] STC 907 .....	339
IRC v Moodie [1993] STC 188 .....	339
IRC v Willoughby [1997] STC 995 .....	339
Lewis v Rook [1992] STC 171 .....	355
MacNiven v Westmoreland Investments Ltd [2001] STC 237 .....	339
Price v Revenue & Customs Commissioners [2015] STC 1975 .....	359
Ramsay v IRC [1981] STC 174 .....	339
Ryall v Hoare [1923] 2 KB 447, 454 .....	142–3
Turner v Follett (1973) 48 TC 614 .....	352

**USA**

Anschutz Co v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 135 TC 78 (2010) .....	396
Arkansas Best Corp v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 485 US 212 (1988) .....	378
Bank of New York Mellon Corp v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 140 TC No 2 (2013) .....	393
Boca Investorings Partnership v United States 314 F 3d 625 (DC Cir, 2003) .....	389
Black & Decker v United States 436 F 3d 431 (4th Cir, 2006) .....	389
Browne v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 73 TC 723 (1980) .....	389
Carlton v United States 385 F 2d 238 (5th Cir, 1967) .....	379
Coltec Industries Inc v United States 454 F 3d 1340 (Fed Cir, 2006) .....	389
Commissioner of Internal Revenue v Clark 489 US 726, 738 (1989) .....	23, 393
Consolidated Edison Co of New York Inc v United States 703 F 3d 1367 (Fed Cir, 2013) .....	393
Debs, Re 158 US 564 (1895) .....	367
Dow Chemical Co v United States 435 F 3d 594 (6th Cir, 2006) .....	389
Doyle v Mitchell Brothers Co 247 US 179, 183 (1918) .....	365
Eisner v Macomber 252 US 189, 207, 214–15 (1920) .....	366–8, 400
Eldorado Coal & Mining Co v Mager 255 US 522 (1921) .....	2–3, 365, 367
Estate of Lang v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 613 F 2d 770 (9th Cir, 1980) .....	389

Evans v Gore 253 US 245 (1920) .....	367
Frank Lyon Co v United States 435 US 561, 583-84 (1978) .....	23, 393
Goodrich v Edwards 255 US 527 (1921) .....	3, 365, 367
Gray v Darlington 82 US (15 Wall) 63 (1872) .....	365
Gregory v Helvering 293 US 465, 469 (1935) .....	23, 383-5, 388, 393
Hays v Gauley Mountain Coal Co 247 US 189, 190 (1918) .....	365
Helmer v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 34 TCM (CCH) 727 (TC, 1975) .....	391-2
Jade Trading LLC v United States 60 Fed Cl 558 (Fed Cl, 2004) .....	392
Long Term Capital Holdings v United States 330 F Supp 2d 122 (D Conn, 2004) .....	389
Long Term Capital Holdings v United States 150 Fed Appx 40 (2nd Cir, 2005) .....	389
Lynch v Turrish 247 US 221, 230-31 (1918) .....	365
Merchants' Loan & Trust Co v Smietanka 255 US 509, 519-21 (1921) .....	2, 365-7
Merrill Lynch & Co Inc v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 386 F 3d 464 (2nd Cir, 2004) .....	389
Minnis v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 71 TC 1049 (1979) .....	389
Neonatology Associates PA v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 299 F 3d 221, 230 (3rd Cir, 2002) .....	23, 393
Palm Canyon X Investments LLC v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 98 TCM (CCH) 574 .....	392
Pinellas Ice & Cold Storage Co v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 287 US 462 (1933) .....	385-6
Pollock v Farmers' Loan and Trust Co 157 US 429 (1895) .....	365, 367
Pollock v Farmers' Loan and Trust Co 158 US 601 (1895) .....	365, 367-8
Rogers v United States 281 F 3d 1108, 1115-17 (10th cir 2002) .....	23, 393
Sims v United States 252 F 2d 434 (4th Cir, 1958), affd 359 US 108 (1959) .....	389
Stanton v Baltic Mining Co 240 US 103 (1916) .....	367
Stubbs, Overbeck & Associates Inc v United States 445 F 2d 1142, 1146-47 (5th Cir, 1971) .....	389
Tebrau (Johore) Rubber Syndicate Ltd v Farmer (1910) 5 TC 658 .....	366
TIFD III-E Inc v United States 459 F 3d 220 (2nd Cir, 2006) .....	389
Towne v Eisner 245 US 418 (1918) .....	367
Tribune Co v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 125 TC 110 (2005) .....	389
United States v Coplan 703 F 3d 46 (2nd Cir, 2012) .....	390-1
United States v EC Knight Co 156 US 1 (1895) .....	367
Wagensen v Commissioner of Internal Revenue 74 TC 653 (1980) .....	379
Walsh v Brewster 255 US 536 (1921) .....	3, 365, 367
Zlotnick v Tie Communications 836 F 2d 818, 820 (3rd Cir, 1988) .....	396