Index

abortion 247–9
abuse of power 2, 10, 68, 70, 86, 145, 160, 161, 164
balance: speed of state intervention and limiting 169
balance between branches 182
checks and balances 152
circular process 167–8
controlled not eliminated 170
detailed and specific rules 90
efficacy analysis 147
fragmentation 151, 166
National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs) 206, 210
natural tendency 171
abusive constitutionalism 34
access
to information 184, 189
to justice 19, 33
Aden Abdihaji & 67 Others v. Malawi, 
MHRC Amicus Curiae 225–7
administrative justice 155
administrative law 63, 156
adoptions 228–31
Africa 57, 90, 186, 228
Burundi 90–92
Kenya 217
Malawi Human Rights Commission (MHRC) see separate entry
pre-colonial 1
South Africa see separate entry
Tanzania 217
Aguas Blancas case 250–251
AIDS/HIV 64–5, 70–71
alternative dispute resolution (ADR) 185–7
American Insurance Ass’n v. Garamendi 122
amicus curiae 183–4, 219, 222, 225–6,
227, 228, 229, 230, 231–2,
234–5
animals 67
anticorruption commissions 37, 46
arbitrators 156
Aristotle 1
association, freedom of 221–5
asylum seekers 225–7
attorneys general 37, 99, 132, 134,
216–17, 247, 252
auditors 10
auditors-general 4, 185, 189
austerity 33
Austin, J. 159
Australia 33
emergency measures during financial crisis 96–7
Australian Conservation Foundation v. Commonwealth 219
authoritarianism 34, 171
Bank Markazi v. Peterson 139
Bentham, J. 159
Blackstone, W. 158
Bond v. United States 210
Bowsher v. Synar 120, 130–131, 132
Brazil 9
corruption investigation 100
impeachment of President Dilmah Roussef 99–100
Brexit 109–10
Buckley v. Valeo 129–30, 132, 133
Burundi: presidential term limit and Constitutional Court 90–92
business 141
see also corporations
Calderón, Felipe 246
Canada 33, 57
Human Rights Commission 192–3
Carpizo, Jorge 243
central banks 155
European 173
Change to constitutions
- Malawi 221–5
- Mexico 251–2
- Procedures 34–5
- Unamendable provisions 35, 223–4
- Unconstitutional constitutional amendment doctrine 6, 18, 35, 37, 52–5, 88, 223–4
- Chavez, Hugo 34
- Checks and balances 38, 86, 88, 89, 106, 113, 146, 147, 168, 179
- Component of separation of powers 149, 150, 152–3, 155
- Court task to settle dispute concerning 108
- Dominant political party 13
- Federal and unitary states 172
- Mexico: autonomous constitutional agencies 242
- National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs) 206, 210, 215, 228, 233, 235
- No-confidence motion 111
- Overlap between functions 68
- Political party competition 140
- Presuppose tension 104
- Slow down process 169
- Third consecutive presidential term 35
- US Constitution 2
- Children
  - Inter-country adoption 228–31
  - Chimango, Louis 225
  - Ciccone, Madonna Louise 228–31
- Civil Liberties Committee v. Minister of Justice and another (CILIC case) 219–20, 222, 232, 233, 234
- Civil society groups/organisations 141, 180, 191, 221, 228
- Colombian Court 42–3, 46, 48
- Court: political improvement model 46, 47, 48, 49, 50
- See also non-governmental organisations
- Classical theory of constitutions 5
- Clinton v. New York 119–20
- Collective rights 7, 8
- Colombia 9, 105, 123, 169, 171
- Commissions and checking institutions 42–3, 48
- Court: constitutional realization model 39–45
- Commissions and checking institutions 42–3
- Information or selection 43–4
- Theory of prioritization 44–5
- Court: political improvement model 48, 49, 50
- Emergency delegated decree power 45
- Equity 51
- Fiscal impact action 53–5
- Fiscal sustainability 53–5
- Insider strategies 45–6
- Legislative behavior 46
- Outsider strategies 46
- Presidential power 45, 52–3, 54
- Public debate 50
- States of emergency 45
- Virtuous and vicious circles 50–52
- Delegation of powers 118
- Democratic dysfunction 36
- Socioeconomic structural injunction cases 39–45
- Fiscal impact action 53–5
- Fiscal sustainability principle 53–5
- Healthcare 40, 41–4, 46, 49, 50–52
- Internally displaced persons (IDPs) 39–44, 46, 48, 49, 50
- Social state of law 53–4, 55
- Unconstitutional constitutional amendment doctrine 35, 52–3
- Commonwealth NHRIs Best Practices 211
- Comparative constitutional law 19, 22, 35
- Comptrollers 155
- Conceptual architecture of separation of powers 25, 145–74
- Basic components 149, 150–6
- Checks and balances 150, 152–3, 155
- Distinct functions 150, 151, 152, 155
- Harmonious collaboration 150, 154–5
- Tripartite division of government 150–151
- Eternal return 149, 167–70
- Nation-state, cosmopolitan utopia
Index

impeachment and criminal prosecution 98–101
judicial review of inherent executive powers 95–6
criminal prosecution of highest elected officials 98–101
cultural, religious and linguistic communities
South Africa: CRL Rights Commission 4, 181, 185, 188, 192, 203

Dames & More v. Regan 122
De Gaulle, Charles 96
death penalty 227–8
deleaged legislation 95, 107, 117–19, 155
Democratic Alliance v. South African Broadcasting Corporation 197, 200
democratic institutions
decreases in centrality and legitimacy of 15–18
distrust of 5–6, 10
dysfunction 36–8
design, constitutional 3–4, 5, 18, 21–2, 101, 209
expansion of rights 7–8
new accountability institutions 9–11, 18, 21, 37
thick and flexible constitutions 5–7, 36–7
transformative constitutionalism 8–9, 38, 39
dignity 66–7, 71, 226, 227
discrimination 184, 189, 191, 192
disqualification of contenders from elected office 98–101
distributive justice 69

Eastern Europe 5–6, 57
Economic Freedom Fighters v. Speaker of the National Assembly 198–200, 201
Ecuador 35, 170
education, right to 154–5
efficiency 68–9, 145
Egypt 106
El Salvador 170
The evolution of the separation of powers

election disputes, judicial review of 98–101
electoral courts or commissions 10, 18, 37, 86
Mexico: Federal Electoral Institute 240
South Africa 181
emergency powers judicial review of 96–8
environment 7
equality 8–9, 53, 171, 172
gender
South Africa: Commission for Gender Equality (CGE) 4, 181, 184, 185, 188, 191, 192, 203
see also inequalities
Erdogan, Recep Tayyip 112
European Union 12, 13, 15, 173
Brexit 109–10
European Council: representative of Poland 92–5
executive branch 9–10, 20, 21, 68, 79, 81, 83, 147, 153–4
Colombia 36, 41–2, 45, 46, 52–3
distinguishing between legislature and 89
expansion of power of 4, 11–15, 22
courts and 24, 85–113
functional specialization 38–9
Mexico 237, 238, 239
Poland 92–5
powers over judiciary 101–3
South Africa 65–6, 86, 98, 101–3
United States see presidential power under United States
expression, freedom of 72, 250
federal systems 86, 171–2
financial crisis 13, 16
emergency powers 96–7
food, right to 47, 76–8
fourth branch 37, 212
South Africa see fourth branch: Chapter 9s under South Africa
see also individual institutions
Fox, Vicente 244
framework constitutionalism 6
France 96
Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board 133–5
Freedom Front v. South African Human Rights Commission and Another 192
fundamental rights 47–8, 95, 103, 128, 145, 169
agents responsible for realising 67
conflation of separation of powers and content of 59–60
problems with 69–71
South African Constitutional Court 61–6
dignity 66–7, 71
negative and positive obligations 67–8
private entities and 17
reconceiving separation of powers and content 83–4
rights and obligations differentiating between 72–3
problematic conflation of 73–6
separation of powers and 76–80
separation of powers, role of judiciary and substance of 80–83
see also human rights commissions; socioeconomic rights
funding 207
judicial branch/courts 101, 104, 105
South Africa: Chapter 9s 181, 189, 202–3, 204
Germany 34, 122
Basic Law 9
generality in legislation 128
Constitutional Court effective opposition 111
delegation of powers 118
Ghana 86, 96
Glenister I 108–9
Glenister II 109
global south
tertemoral theories of judicial role in see separate entry
theory of separation of powers 18–22
see also individual countries
globalization 15
Grootboom 62–3, 184, 194–5, 196

David Bilchitz and David Landau - 9781785369773
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 04/13/2019 11:21:21AM
via free access
### Index

**Hamdi v. Rumsfeld** 122  
hate speech 192  
healthcare 7  
   - Colombian Court  
     - structural orders 40, 41–4, 46, 49, 50–52  
   - South African Court 61–2, 64–5, 73–4  
historical context 18  
HIV/AIDS 64–5, 70–71  
**Hlohe** case 101–3  
Honduras 35  
housing, right to 7, 48–9, 82–3  
   - *Grootboom* 62–3, 184, 194–5, 196  
human rights commissions 10–11, 37, 86, 206–8  
   - Canada 192–3  
   - enforcement 207  
   - SAHRC 196  
   - funding 207  
   - SAHRC 203  
   - general framework 208–13  
   - state party treaty reports 210–211  
   - independence 201, 207, 210, 212, 214–15, 236–7, 241, 243  
Malawi Human Rights Commission (MHRC) *see separate entry*  
Mexican Commission on Human Rights (CNDH) *see separate entry*  
South Africa (SAHRC) 4, 181, 182–5  
   - *amicus curiae* 183, 184  
   - appointment of Chairperson 201  
   - complaints-handling and investigations 184–5  
   - complementarity of Constitutional Court and 182–3  
   - findings or recommendations 196  
   - independence 201  
   - interpretive and advisory function 192–3  
   - lack of clarity on role 194–6  
   - litigation 183–4, 194–6, 217  
   - *locus standi* in Equality Courts 184  
   - promoting rights 187, 188  
   - research and monitoring 189–90  
   - restorative justice 185  
   - shaping policy and legislation 191  
   - under-resourced 203  
   - *sui generis* 212, 214, 215, 233–4  
   - Human Rights Watch 245, 246  
   - Humphrey’s Executor v. United States 129, 132, 134  
   - Hungary 14–15, 17, 88, 106  
   - Huq, A.Z. 209–10  
   - impeachment 98–101, 129, 131, 132, 135, 153, 238, 240  
   - India 9, 57, 105  
   - democratic dysfunction 36  
   - Supreme Court 35–6  
   - emergency powers 96  
   - political improvement model 47, 49, 50, 52  
   - indigenous rights 19, 33  
   - inequalities 9, 18–19, 21, 142–3  
   - gender 191  
   - *see also* equality  
   - *I.N.S. v. Chadha* 118–19  
   - Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR) 243, 244–5, 251, 252  
   - internally displaced persons (IDPs) 39–44, 46, 48, 49, 50  
   - International Court of Justice (ICJ) 122  
   - international human rights law 226–7  
       - minimum core 44  
       - *see also* human rights commissions; socioeconomic rights  
   - international law 159, 229  
   - intertemporal theories of judicial role in global south 21, 23, 31–56  
   - constitutional realization model 38–45, 55  
       - capacity 41, 42–3, 44–5  
       - information or selection 53–4  
       - legitimacy 41–2  
       - theory of prioritization 44–5  
       - democratic dysfunction 32–3, 36–8, 52  
       - constitutional fragility 34–6  
       - political improvement model 45–55  
       - anticorruption approach 46, 47–8
The evolution of the separation of powers

United States see Supreme Court
under United States

jus cogens 227

Kaczynski, Lech 92–3
Kafantayeni v. Attorney General,
MHRC Amicus Curiae 227–8
Kajoloweka, Ex parte 233
Kenya 217
Keserue v Keserue 230
King v. Burwell 143
Kiska, Andrej 101
Kruger v. President of the Republic of
South Africa and Others 98

Ireland 57

Israeli Supreme Court
delegated executive rulemaking 95
indicted or convicted politicians in
cabinet 99

Johnson, Andrew 128–9
judicial branch/courts 9–11, 17–18, 19,
22, 68, 153–5, 169
activism 18, 36, 39–56, 106–7, 168
appointments 101, 104, 105
courts and expansion of executive
power see separate entry
dominant-party system 13, 20, 21,
36, 46, 47, 48
enforcement 101, 104
executive powers over 101–3
expansion of executive power 13,
14–15
funding 101, 104, 105
‘good governance courts’ 18, 20–21
intertemporal theories of judicial
role in global south see separate
entry
Mexico 237, 238, 239–40
reform 167–8
socioeconomic rights 7–8, 20, 22, 33,
39–45, 46, 48, 49, 50–5
competency 59, 60, 81
indeterminacy 60
legitimacy 41–2, 57, 59, 81
separation of powers and content
of 23–4, 57–84
thick and flexible constitutions 6–7
unconstitutional constitutional
amendment doctrine 6, 18, 35,
37, 52–5, 88, 223–4

Koscielny, Lech 92–3
Kafantayeni v. Attorney General,
MHRC Amicus Curiae 227–8
Kajoloweka, Ex parte 233
Kenya 217
Keserue v Keserue 230
King v. Burwell 143
Kiska, Andrej 101
Kruger v. President of the Republic of
South Africa and Others 98

Laski, Harold 159
Latin America 9, 11, 17, 57, 147
see also individual countries
Le Brun, Charles 161
legal anthropology 159
legislative branch 9–10, 68, 79, 81, 83,
153–4
Colombia 36, 41–2, 43, 45–6
constitutional review of legislation
106, 119–20, 123–8, 136–9, 169
delegated legislation 95, 107, 117–19
design of 169–70
distinguishing between executive
and 89
expansion of executive power 11–15,
86, 107
functional specialization 38–9
funding of judiciary 101
Mexico 237, 238, 239, 240
policymaking 37
public trust 15–16
South Africa 65–6
oversight of ‘fourth branch’
institutions 181–2
United States see Congress under
United States
Lincoln, Abraham 128
lobbying 16, 115
Locke, John 1, 68, 146, 164, 208, 212
Louis XIV 157, 161
Lula da Silva, Luiz Inácio 99
McCord, Ex parte 136, 137–8
Madison, James 68, 89, 134, 152
Madonna Louise Ciccone 228–31
Index

pharmaceutical drugs 17

_Plaut v. Spendthrift Farms_ 139

_Poland_ 17

conflict between President and Prime Minister in foreign affairs 92–5, 107, 112

police 108, 193, 243, 250

political parties 17, 140, 242, 254

constitutional courts: sanction or ban anti-democratic 34, 46–7

dominant 13, 20, 21, 36, 46, 47, 48

global south 20, 21

Malawi: crossing floor of Parliament and freedom of association 221–5

weak 13–14, 46, 48

polycentric issues 59

positivism 159

president and prime minister, competence conflict between 92–5, 107, 112

_Presidential Reference_ case (Malawi) 222–4


privatization of public power 16–17

_Procuraduría General de la Nación_ (National Inspector General): Colombia 42

_procurators_ 10

prosecutors 37, 243

public ministry (_ministerio público_) 155

Public Protector (PP): South Africa 3, 181, 185, 197–202

public trust/distrust 5–6, 10, 15–16, 17, 18, 20–21, 241–2

Pufendorf, Samuel 158

Putin, Vladimir 112

Rabin, Yitzhak 99

reasonableness approach: South African Constitutional Court and socioeconomic rights 63–6, 71, 74, 79–80

Israeli Supreme Court: ministerial appointments 99

_Rediffusion (Hong Kong) Ltd v. Attorney-General of Hong Kong and Another_ 109

referendum amendment to French Constitution and formally unconstitutional 96

Brexit 110

corporate tiers 35

entrenched provisions in Malawi Constitution 224

struck down: proposal to hold 52–3

refugees 225–7

_Registered Trustees of the Public Affairs Committee v. Attorney-General and another, Malawi Human Rights Commission (Amicus Curiae) (PAC case)_ 219, 221–2, 224–5, 234–5

religion and politics 156–7, 161

restorative justice 185

rhetoric of terrorism 12–13

_Stephen v. Seattle Audubon Society_ 138

Romania 106

Roussef, Dilmah 99–100

Russia 88, 112

_S v. Jordan_ 192

Santos, Juan Manuel 53

secret or open ballot and no-confidence motion 86, 110–112

_Slovak Constitution: appointment of Constitutional Court justices_ 101

social contract 157, 159, 163

socioeconomic rights 7–8, 22, 23–4, 33, 154, 210

_Colombian Court_ fiscal impact action 53–5

fiscal sustainability principle 53–5

structural injunction cases 39–45, 46, 48, 49, 50–52, 53–4

global north 33

global south 19–20

separation of powers and content of 20, 23–4, 57–84

conflation 59–66

differentiating between rights and obligations 72–3

minimum core approach 63, 64
Index

normative underpinnings 66–9
problematic conflation of rights and obligations 73–6
problems with conflating 69–71
reasonableness approach 63–6, 71, 74, 79–80
reconceiving 83–4
rights, obligations and separation of powers 76–80
role of judiciary 80–83
see also human rights commissions
Soobramoney v. Minister of Health (Kwazulu-Natal) 61–2, 73–4
South Africa 105, 106
Constitutional Court 69–70, 71–2, 80, 83–4, 123, 178–9
conflation of content of socioeconomic rights and separation of powers 61–6
dominant-party democracy 36, 46, 47–8
healthcare 61–2, 64–5, 73–4
housing 48–9, 62–3
no remedy when legislative process complete 108–9
no-confidence vote against President 86, 110–112
organized crime and corruption investigation body 108–9
presidential emergency powers 98
public/private line 16
reasonableness approach 63–6, 71, 74, 79–80
SAHRC and 182–3, 194–6
water allowance 65–6, 70–71, 74
Zuma prosecution and subsequent litigation 101–3
fourth branch: Chapter 9s 3–4, 21, 25–6, 177–205
appointment and selection of principals 181, 201
Auditor-General 4, 185, 189
challenges 194–203, 204–5
Commission for Gender Equality (CGE) 4, 181, 184, 185, 188, 191, 192, 203
CRL Rights Commission 4, 181, 185, 188, 192, 203
funding 181, 189, 202–3, 204
governance function 182, 195, 200, 204
independence and authority of 181–2, 193, 200–202
interpretive and advisory function 192–4, 204
lack of clarity on role 194–6
‘new’ separation of powers 179–80
oversight by legislature 181–2
President’s private residence, upgrades to 198–9, 201
promotional/public education mandates 188–9
Public Protector (PP) 3, 181, 185, 197–202
(quasi-)judicial functions and ADR 183–8, 204
recommendations, nature and enforceability of 196–200, 204
research and monitoring 189–90, 204
separation of powers: doctrine in context 178–9
shaping policy and legislation 191–2, 204
subpoena 196
under-resourced 189, 202–3, 204
healthcare 61–2, 73–4
provision of anti-retroviral drug 64–5
housing 48–9, 62–3
Independent Communications Authority of South Africa (ICASA) 193
‘Oilgate’ scandal 200–201
Pan South African Language Board 180
police 108, 193
private entities and fundamental rights 17
Public Service Commission 180
public trust 16
South African Reserve Bank 180

David Bilchitz and David Landau - 9781785369773
Downloaded from Elgar Online at 04/13/2019 11:21:21AM
via free access
The evolution of the separation of powers

transformative constitutionalism 8–9
water allowance 65–6, 70–71, 74
spillover effects 49–50
Sri Lanka 106
Stanton, Edwin 129
superintendents 10
Tanzania 217
Temer, Michel 99, 100
term limits on presidency 90–92
terrorism-related rhetoric 12–13
transformative constitutionalism 8–9, 38, 39
transformative mediators 187
Treatment Action Campaign 64–5, 74
Trump, Donald 17
trust/distrust 5–6, 10, 15–16, 17, 18, 20–21, 241–2
Turkey 88, 106, 112
Tusk, Donald 92–3

United Kingdom
Brexit 109–10
executive powers 87–8, 109–10
United Nations 191, 207
High Commissioner for Human Rights 244
High Commissioner for Refugees 225, 226
United States 17, 22, 24–5, 56, 114–44
Affordable Care Act 143
appointment and removal of federal officials 128–35
for-cause limit on removal 129, 132–5
Attorney General 132, 134
budget, federal 119–20, 131
Congress 114–16, 143–4, 147, 170
appointment and removal of federal officials 128–35
as central democratic institution 117–20
constitutional limits on presidential power and 121–3
due process and generality in legislation 123–8, 142
importance of separation of legislative and executive powers 139–43
jurisdiction of courts 136–7
legislative interference with judicial decisions 137–9
non-delegation doctrine 117–18, 141–2
Constitution: federal 2, 5, 118, 120, 141
Appointments 128, 129, 130, 133
Bill of Attainder 123, 126
Equal Protection 123
judicial power 137, 138
Constitution: states 6
cueing 116, 143
emergencies 97–8
habeas corpus 105, 137
indigenous rights 33
national security 97
presidential power 87, 97–8, 114–15, 116, 143–4, 147
appointment and removal of officers 104, 128–35
Congress and constitutional limits on 121–3
‘enemy combatants’ in war on terror 105, 122
executive orders: undocumented immigrants 123
federal budget 119–20
importance of separation of legislative and executive powers 139–43
special counsel 131–3, 134
structural injunctions 43
Supreme Court 2, 14, 114, 115–16, 135–6, 143–4, 210
appointment and removal of federal officials 128–35
Congress and constitutional limits on presidential power 121–3
due process and generality in legislation 123–8, 142
‘enemy combatants’ in war on terror 105, 122
federal budgets and Congress 119–20
importance of separation of
| legislative and executive powers 139–43 | Vattel, Emer de 158 |
| legislative interference with judicial decisions 137–9 | Venezuela 34, 88, 170 |
| nomination of justices to 104 non-delegation doctrine: Congress 117–18, 141–2 | Venice Commission 112 |
| presumptions in favor of judicial review 136–7 | water, right to 8, 65–6, 70–71, 74 |
| veto of agency action by Congress 118–19 | Weimar Republic 34 |
| voting, exclusions from 143 | Wilsa case 231–3, 234 |
| United States v. Klein 138 | women's rights 231–3, 234 |
| United States v. Lovett 126 | Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer 121–2 |
| Uribe, Alvaro 35, 52–3, 54 | Zedillo, Ernesto 244 |
| Zuma, Jacob 86, 101–2 |